

Vol. XXIX

ISSN 2073-0926



NDU  
**Journal** 2015

---

[www.ndu.edu.pk](http://www.ndu.edu.pk)

## NDU Journal

Institute for Strategic Studies, Research & Analysis  
National Defence University, Islamabad

---

---

### Editorial Board

|  |                  |
|--|------------------|
| Lieutenant General Anwar Ali Hyder, HI (M) | Patron-in-Chief  |
| Major General Noel Israel Khokhar, HI (M)  | Patron           |
| Lieutenant Colonel Abdul Basit             | Editor           |
| Ms. Qurat ul Ain                           | Assistant Editor |

---

---

### Advisory Board

|                                 |   |
|---------------------------------|---|
| Rear Admiral Adnan Nazir, HI(M) | Chief Instructor, Allied Officers Division, NDU, Islamabad  |
| Ambassador Najmuddin A. Shaikh  | Former Foreign Secretary Pakistan   |
| Ambassador Dr. Maleeha Lodhi    | Permanent Representative of Pakistan to the United Nations – USA  |
| Dr. Syed Rifaat Hussain         | HoD, Policy and Public Administration, School of Social Sciences and Humanities, NUST, Islamabad                  |
| Dr. Zulfqar Khan                | HoD (Strategic Studies), FCS, NDU Islamabad   |
| Dr. Noman Hanif                 | Department of Politics, School of Social Sciences, History and Philosophy, Birkbeck College, University of London |
| Prof. Arshin Adib-Moghaddam     | Professor, University of London   |
| Prof Takako Hirose              | Faculty of International Relations, Daito Bunka University, Japan   |
| Prof. Dr. Shaun Gregory         | HoD, Department of Peace Studies, University of Bradford, UK  |
| Prof. Dr. Bulent Aras           | Faculty of Arts and Social Sciences, Sabanci University, Istanbul, Turkey   |

---

---

NDU Journal is sponsored and edited by the Institute for Strategic Studies, Research & Analysis (ISSRA), National Defence University, Islamabad, Pakistan. Manuscripts and editorial communications may be directed to the editor.

**Statements, facts and opinions mentioned in NDU Journal are solely of the authors and do not imply the official policy of the institution, editors and publisher.**

**Website: <http://www.ndu.edu.pk>  
Email: [ddpubnres@ndu.edu.pk](mailto:ddpubnres@ndu.edu.pk)**

# **NDU Journal**

## **Subscription for one copy**

- Inland Rs. 500/-
- Overseas US \$ 25/-

## **Request for subscription may be addressed to:**

Editor NDU Journal  
National Defence University  
Sector E-9, Islamabad, Pakistan  
Tel: +92-51-9260651-52 (Extn 5269)  
Fax: +92-51-9260663

**Website: <http://www.ndu.edu.pk>**  
**Email: [ddpubnres@ndu.edu.pk](mailto:ddpubnres@ndu.edu.pk)**  
**ISSN: 2073-0926**

**Published by**  
**National Defence University**  
**Islamabad – Pakistan**



*CONTENTS*

|   | <b>Page No</b> |
|---|----------------|
| • <b>Biosecurity and Pakistan: A Critical Appraisal</b><br><i>Dr. Zafar Nawaz Jaspal</i>  | 1              |
| • <b>Perspectives on Pakistan's National Security</b><br><i>Noel Israel Khokhar</i>   | 35             |
| • <b>India's Look East Policy: Challenges and Options for Pakistan</b><br><i>Raja Qaiser Ahmed</i>  | 55             |
| • <b>Counter Extremists' Narrative in Pakistan</b><br><i>Fatima Sajjad</i>  | 75             |
| • <b>Struggling IDPs of North Waziristan in the Wake of Operation Zarb-e-Azb</b><br><i>Nida Hameed</i>  | 95             |
| • <b>The Evolving Dynamics of Deterrence Stability in South Asia</b><br><i>Muhammad Shafiq ur Rehman and Dr. Muhammad Saif ur Rehman</i>          | 117            |
| • <b>Legal Perspective of Kashmir Issue</b><br><i>Dr. Raja Muhammad Khan</i>  | 135            |
| • <b>Use of Print Media for Conflict Resolution and Peace Building: A Case Study of Kashmir Dispute</b><br><i>Dr. Anjum Zia and Hajrah Syedah</i> | 161            |
| • <b>Governance in Pakistan: Legitimacy Regime of NGOs</b><br><i>Tahir Ul Mulk Kahlon</i>   | 181            |

‘NDU Journal’ is an annual publication of National Defence University, the premier institution of security and strategic studies. The journal is a unique publication of the country which primarily deals with the national security issues of Pakistan. The journal has its own standing among the students, researchers, experts, policy makers and intelligentsia. It has been enlisted by International Political Science Abstracts, USA, Bibliography of Asian Studies USA and Ulrichs Periodicals Directory. Keeping the flag high, all the articles appearing in the journal are selected after a rigorous scrutiny and blind peer review at home and abroad. It is the testimony of quality of contents of the journal that **Higher Education Commission of Pakistan** has upgraded the journal to ‘Y’ category.

# **BIOSECURITY AND PAKISTAN: A CRITICAL APPRAISAL**

*Dr. Zafar Nawaz Jaspal*

## **Abstract**

*The biological threats have been arising from both natural and man-made pathogens. Indeed, the dual-use characteristic of biological research increases the chances of its misuse. The biological research dissemination, however, could not be banned because of the immense use of biological agents in human medicines, veterinary prosperity, and agriculture productivity. The benevolent and malevolent use of biological sciences intensifies the significance of Biosecurity. Despite its importance, Biosecurity receives inconsequential attention in Pakistan. The focus on Biosecurity in Pakistan is not much different from other developing countries. The people of Pakistan are vulnerable to Biosecurity related challenges. The complex nature of Biosecurity challenges and underscores that no nation and no institution is capable to deal with them on its own. The only way to deal with these threats and challenges is through an integrated and allied strategic approach, which includes both non-military and military capabilities of like*

## **Introduction**

The revolution in biological-sciences and biological-technology signifies Biosecurity in the twenty-first century.<sup>1</sup> Biosecurity is often interchangeably used or confused with Bio-safety. The concepts of Bio-safety and Biosecurity deal with related, but distinctly different puzzles. Bio-safety is a well-established concept with a widely-accepted meaning and international guidance on how it is put into practice at the national level.<sup>2</sup> The Bio-safety measures aim to prevent the unintentional exposure to pathogens and toxins, or their accidental release.<sup>3</sup> The term Biosecurity is a comparatively new one, and thereby its' concept has been evolving. Since 2003, in the setting of the Biological and Toxin Weapons

Convention (BTWC), Biosecurity has most commonly been used to refer to the mechanisms that establish and maintain the security and oversight of pathogenic microorganisms, toxins and relevant resources.<sup>4</sup> Hence, Biosecurity protects germs from people. And its measures focus on the prevention of theft, misuse, or intentional release of pathogens and toxins.<sup>5</sup> Today, however, the Biosecurity scope is broader than the BTWC delineation.

The impressive advancements in biotechnology or rapid advances in genetic engineering and the study of pathogenesis (the molecular mechanisms by which microbes cause disease) alarm that terrorists' could be able to create "improved" bio-warfare agents for their nefarious objectives. The ability of scientists to produce life from scratch provides an option to the terrorist group to synthesize deadly pathogens having greater lethality, environmental stability, difficulty of detection, and resistance to existing drugs and vaccines. Jonathan B. Tucker pointed out: "The efficient dispersal of a few kilograms of a biological agent, such as the dried spores of the anthrax bacterium, over a troop concentration or a major city could sicken or kill many thousands of people."<sup>6</sup> Tucker's anxiety about biological agents was shared by numerous security observers, who believed that "Biotechnology is one of the two technologies that truly deserve the label 'agent of mass destruction' and it is by far the more accessible of the two."<sup>7</sup> Tucker also pointed out that: "the limited quantities of biological agent required for a devastating attack could be produced with small-scale equipment, occupying perhaps only a single room, and nearly all such equipment is dual-use and available throughout the world."<sup>8</sup> The dual-use phenomenon added a subverting variable in the Biosecurity. In simple words, a scientists or laboratory technician can steal a small quantity of dangerous pathogens and use it to develop biological weapon himself or pass it onto a terrorist group for monetary or even ideological reasons.<sup>9</sup>

Although, the bioterrorism centralized Biosecurity debate, especially after the anthrax use in fall 2001, yet it has kept the discourse within the traditional security paradigm. The Severe



Acute Respiratory Syndrome (SARS) contagion in 2002-2003,<sup>10</sup> Influenza A virus epidemic of 2006 (avian influenza), 2007 Equine influenza, 2009 Swine flu and again the Swine flu pandemic outbreak in India in December 2014,<sup>11</sup> have alarmed security analysts. Consequently, Biosecurity has emerged as an important area of investigation for the Human Security analysts in the developed world. Conversely, bioterrorism, emerging diseases (SARS) or reemerging infectious disease (tuberculosis, plague) and pandemic flu strains, which are all within the context of rapid global travel, have failed to draw serious response in the developing states.

The focus on Biosecurity in Pakistan is not much different from the other developing states. The people of Pakistan are vulnerable to the Biosecurity related challenges. It was reported that on April 14, 2015, a 57-year-old man died in Lahore after allegedly contracting swine flu.<sup>12</sup> On May 8, 2015, a person died in Islamabad due to Crimean-Congo Hemorrhagic Fever (CCHF).<sup>13</sup> Three deaths caused by *Naegleria fowleri*, commonly known as the 'brain-eating' amoeba, in Karachi during the first half of 2015.<sup>14</sup> Around 500 camels infected by 'mysterious disease' in Noorpur Thal (District Khushab-Punjab) and adjoining areas in May 2015.<sup>15</sup> Despite the government of Pakistan's serious efforts, Polio remains endemic disease in the country.<sup>16</sup> Today, "Pakistan is far away from target set by WHO and we failed to completely eradicate polio from Pakistan.<sup>17</sup> According to the Global Polio Eradication Initiative (GPEI), four sanctuaries for the polio virus exist in Pakistan, i.e. Quetta, the districts of Qila Abdullah and Pishin and Karachi.<sup>18</sup>

The mosquito borne diseases are common in Pakistan. For example, in 2011, Dengue caused havoc in Lahore.<sup>19</sup> The foot-and-mouth (FMD—a pathogen of cattle and other ungulates) disease is very common in the rural areas of Pakistan.<sup>20</sup> The common man live stocks in the rural areas of the country suffered immensely from this disease. Similarly, Pakistani agriculture sector, especially citrus and mango growing regions are sufferer of diseases affecting the trees and plants. The citrus greening, caused by the bacteria *Liberibacter*

*asiaticus*<sup>21</sup> takes its toll on the productivity of the citrus. The mango growers' economy severely affected during the recent years, especially in District Multan and Sind province. The repetition of the diseases reflects the poor management of Biosecurity in Pakistan.

The objective of this study is to critically examine the Biosecurity's puzzles. The key research questions are: What is meant by Biosecurity? What is the Spectrum of the Biosecurity threat? What are the alarming facts? What is the situation in Pakistan? The answers of these questions assist us in chalking out the appropriate countermeasures to redress the Biosecurity challenges in the twenty-first century. The first section contains discussion on the theoretical contextualization. It is followed by securitization of Biosecurity phenomenon. The third section briefly highlights the spectrum of biological threats. The fourth section deliberates about Pakistan and Biosecurity. The fifth section contains discussion on the Biosecurity related challenges to Pakistan. The final section contains countermeasures.

### **Theoretical Contextualization**

The Traditional and Non-Traditional security theorists have been critically examining the significant issues like bio-risks, bio-safety, and bio-security that impinge on daily human existence and welfare. In the traditional security paradigm, the BTWC prevents biological warfare and the deliberate use of disease as a weapon. The Convention, however, has failed to eradicate the stocks of Biological weapons completely, because of the absence of verification and enforcement mechanism. The Convention also could not dissuade the use of Biological agents by the local, national and international terrorist groups for their nefarious objectives in the prevailing asymmetrical warfare.

The Non-Traditional Security school of thought warned that the entire world has been gradually inching towards bio-insecurity. While discussing current non-traditional security threats, Mely Caballero-Anthony pointed out: "Aside from

being non-military in nature, these challenges share other common characteristics: they are transnational in scope (neither purely domestic nor purely inter-state); they arise at very short notice and are transmitted rapidly as a result of globalization and the communication revolution; they cannot be prevented entirely, but can be mitigated through coping mechanisms; national solutions are often inadequate, and thus regional and multilateral cooperation is essential; and finally, the object of security is no longer just the state (state sovereignty and territorial integrity) but also the people — their survival, well-being and dignity, at both individual and societal level.”<sup>22</sup> This understanding of non-traditional security challenges underscores that infectious disease, such as the severe acute respiratory syndrome (SARS), the H5N1-Bird flu virus, etc, have the capacity to detrimentally affect national security.

The non-traditional security theorists also pointed out that Biosecurity of a state is very much vulnerable to the atmospheric changes due to natural calamity and man-made environmental degrading agents and population growth. The state’s national policies for food security and scientific inventions for the comfortability of citizens have serious repercussions for global atmospheric system. In spite of this, people have non-serious approach towards Biosecurity and therefore, the link between combating biological weapons and combating infectious diseases has not yet been established. This raises a question: how real is the threat? More precisely, demographic change, climate change, economic growth and the rising demand for resources have all posed serious threat to Biosecurity. Hence, there is a need to prevent, deter and deal with the threat of Biosecurity.

### **Securitization of Biosecurity**

The rise of Non-Traditional security concept and asymmetric warfare pattern in the inter-state and intra-state theaters have signified Biosecurity puzzle in the post-Cold War security calculus.<sup>23</sup> Laura A. Meyerson and Jamie K. Reaser argued that: “Imported goods and animals can harbor

undetected species such as microbial pathogens, arthropods, or plant seeds with the potential to become invasive and cause significant harm.”<sup>24</sup> The U.S. anthrax attacks in 2001 and revelations about al Qaeda’s attempts to develop a Biological Weapons (BW) program alarmed the policymakers, particularly Bush Administration in the United States about the Biosecurity imbroglio. Kendall Hoyt and Stephen G. Brooks argued: “Even before the anthrax attacks in the fall of 2001, there was a growing understanding within the security and global health communities that pathogens pose a threat equal to, if not greater than, military might. Biological weapons offer a relatively inexpensive and surreptitious method of inflicting mass casualties.”<sup>25</sup> Notwithstanding, the term Biosecurity was originally used to describe an approach designed to prevent or decrease the spread of naturally occurring infectious diseases and pests in crops and livestock. The approach’s primary concern was the threats to animal and plant health and to biodiversity, which might have an indirect impact on human health, but not direct effect. More precisely, in veterinary and agricultural fields the term denoted protecting biological resources from foreign or invasive species. In the late 1990s, the threat of bioterrorism gave a new definition to Biosecurity. In this context, Biosecurity is defined as “the protection of microbial (bacteria causing diseases) agents from loss, theft, diversion or intentional use.”<sup>26</sup> During the last decade, the scholars having multidisciplinary background had intensively debated the concept of Biosecurity. The primary objective of the debate was to ensure the physical security of a designated list of dangerous pathogens. Consequently, Biosecurity definition has become more explicit and its focus has been broadened.<sup>27</sup>

Since, the US Federal Bureau of Investigation’s (FBI) conclusion (in August 2008) that Bruce Ivins, a scientist at the US Army Medical Research Institute of Infectious Disease (USAMRIID), was the sole perpetrator of the 2001 anthrax letters attack, greater attention has been paid to ensure the reliability of personnel with access to microbial agents.<sup>28</sup> Bruce Ivins terrorism act had further intensified the significance of both protection of microbial and dual-use

biotechnology from scientists' intentional misuse. This introduced a comprehensive perspective of Biosecurity. For instance, the United States National Academy of Science defined Biosecurity as: "security against the inadvertent, inappropriate, or intentional malicious or malevolent use of potentially dangerous biological agents or biotechnology, including the development, production, stockpiling, or use of biological weapons as well as outbreaks of newly emergent and epidemic disease."<sup>29</sup> While discussing the National Academy of Science definition of Biosecurity Gregory D. Koblentz pointed out that: "This definition is characterized by the inclusion of both deliberate and natural sources of disease outbreaks, the threats posed by pathogens as well as biotechnology, and the vulnerability of humans, plants, and animals to biological threats."<sup>30</sup> This understanding of Biosecurity necessitated the protection of germs from people. So that; an individual or a group could not steal, misuse, or intentionally release the pathogens and toxins.<sup>31</sup>

The Americans' realization of the intensity of biological related threats contributed positively in the Biosecurity debate. In the aftermath of 2001 Anthrax letter attacks, Biosecurity has become one of the primary security concerns in the United States. Its' National Science Advisory Board on Biosecurity while keeping in consideration the oversight of dual-use research, warned that a "biological research with legitimate scientific purpose that may be misused to pose a biological threat to public health and/or national security."<sup>32</sup> It has broadened the scope of Biosecurity beyond the pathogenic organisms that were the focus of previous definitions to include techniques and technologies that can be used to create new pathogenic organisms or biologically active compounds.

Although dual-use characteristic of biological research increases the chances of misuse, yet its dissemination cannot be prohibited due to the use of biological agents in human medicine, veterinary prosperity, and agriculture productivity. Moreover, under the Article I of the BTWC States Parties are authorized to acquire and manipulate pathogens for

protective, prophylactic (refers activities related to the protection of the human body from the effects of organisms or substances to which an individual might be directly exposed) and other peaceful purposes. Such activities include biological defense programs. The dissemination and legitimate biological defense programs increase the probability of biological attacks; boost emergence and re-emergence of biological diseases, and also make difficult to distinguish legitimate from illicit research and development activities. Though, the Australia Group controls or limits the export of materials and technologies relevant to the production of chemical and biological weapons to proliferant countries as well as non-state actors, such as terrorists,<sup>33</sup> yet this control apparatus is inconclusive.

The dual-use biological equipment-items that can be used for both peaceful research and biological weapons production, and the global expansion of the biotechnology and pharmaceutical sectors undermine the effectiveness of Australia Group export controls mechanism. Realizing the loopholes in Australia Group controlling system; the United States executed 'Patriot Act of 2001 and the Public Health Security and Bioterrorism Preparedness Act of 2002', which criminalized the unauthorized possession, use, or transfer of the forty-nine biological agents or toxins listed by HHS. Individuals working with these agents must register with HHS and institute access controls, handling and reporting requirements, and personnel screening for their laboratories.<sup>34</sup> Despite these arrangements; Biosecurity remains vulnerable to acute risks. The dual applications of Chimeric Organism, Synthetic Biology, Synthetic Genomics, Molecular Biology, Bioregulators, and Genomic sciences or the "new biology" could be misused to undermine Biosecurity.

### **Spectrum of Biological Threats**

The preceding section underscores the biological threats arising from natural or man-made pathogen. It identifies factors that pose challenge to Biosecurity and draws our attention to the reality that there is a broad array of biological

threats, natural as well as deliberate. It marked the risk that misuse of the life sciences could result in the deliberate or inadvertent release of biological material in a manner that sickens or kills people, animals, or plants, or renders unusable critical resources. The following table explains the spectrum of biological risks, ranging from natural occurring factious disease to deliberate use of disease as a weapon.

### **Spectrum of Biological Threats**

| Naturally occurring diseases | Resurrect infectious diseases | Unintended consequences of research | Laboratory incidents | Lack of awareness | Negligence | Deliberate misuse |
|------------------------------|-------------------------------|-------------------------------------|----------------------|-------------------|------------|-------------------|
|------------------------------|-------------------------------|-------------------------------------|----------------------|-------------------|------------|-------------------|

Source: Terence Taylor, "Safeguarding Advances in the Life Sciences," *EMBO Reports*, Vol. 7, Special Issue (July 2006), p. S61. <http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC1490302/pdf/7400725.pdf>, accessed on September 15, 2010.

### **Biosecurity and Pakistan**

Pakistan has developed a modest bioscience and biotechnological infrastructure. It is a debatable variable that whether or not Islamabad is sensitive to the gravity of Biosecurity challenges. Nevertheless, Islamabad has taken a few constructive measures, which generate impression that the Government of Pakistan has not entirely insensitive to the Biosecurity quandary. For instance, Pakistan is party to BTWC and Convention on Biodiversity. It is signatory to the 2001 Cartagena Protocol on Biodiversity,<sup>35</sup> and had promulgated a national legislation entitled, *Export Control on Goods, Technologies, Material and Equipment related to Nuclear and Biological Weapons and their Delivery Systems Act, 2004* in September 2004.<sup>36</sup> In addition, the National Institute of Health (NIH) located at Islamabad regularly refurbishes guidelines and monitors research in life sciences to protect Pakistani citizens from any precarious use of dangerous pathogens. Its public health strategy has been focusing on the eradication of microbes by using powerful medical weaponry, i.e. antibiotics, anti-malarias vaccines, etc. On June 22, 2005, Ambassador Masood Khan, Pakistan's permanent

representative at Geneva claimed at the Meeting of Experts to the Convention on the Prohibition of the Development, Production and Stockpiling of Bacteriological (Biological) and Toxin Weapons and on their Destruction that Pakistan had adopted following measures for the protection of human beings, animals and plants:

- It developed an elaborate system, supported by 2,000 reporting stations, for early detection and surveillance of diseases.
- Its National Bio-safety guidelines covering laboratories, research field studies and commercial release of (GMOs) Genetically Modified Organisms and products thereof - were approved in May 2005. These guidelines have the support of the academic institutions, R & D organizations, NGOs, and industry and are in conformity with UNIDO, FAO, WHO, and UNEP guidelines duly adapted to Pakistani socio-economic and geographical environment.
- The National Institute of Health (NIH) developed and implemented a code of conduct in accordance with the International Health Regulations (IHR) adopted by the World Health Assembly.
- A Bio-safety Committee has been set up to monitor the research and development activities in life sciences and ensures that the conduct of the scientists in consonance with the provisions of the BTWC.
- Faculties and students of leading universities and research institutions have been sensitized of their responsibilities for Bio-safety and Biosecurity. The premier institutions have been encouraged to develop their own codes of conduct.
- In September 2004, Pakistan enacted an Act of Parliament to control export, re-export, trans-shipment and transit of goods, technologies, material and equipment related to nuclear and biological weapons.<sup>37</sup>

The preceding discussion generates impression that Islamabad is very much responsive to the Biosecurity and Bio-safety problems. In reality, these arrangements have



constructive effect in the realm of Bio-safety, but have limited outcome in the sphere of Biosecurity. Importantly, Pakistan cannot get rid of infectious diseases completely because microbes and the insects, rodents, and other animals that transmit infectious diseases are in a constant state of biological flux and evolution. Secondly, dual-use biological agents are regularly used in the Pakistani laboratories ranging from those in colleges and universities to more advanced national institutions and the research and development facilities run by pharmaceutical companies. Thirdly, it has a less developed health-care infrastructures, especially in the rural areas. It is an open secret that pharmaceutical availability is restricted to urban centers. Whereas, majority of the Pakistanis reside in rural areas, and thereby medical care is unavailable to a larger section of the population/society in the country. Above all, the people have intimidating indifference to the Biosecurity.

### **Pakistan: Intimidating Indifference**

Pakistan today, is countering both interstate and intrastate security challenges. Since 9/11, its Federal Administrative Tribal Areas (FATA) has become the epicenter of the transnational terrorist organizations, to be called “Terrorist Syndicate led by al Qaeda”, nefarious activities.<sup>38</sup> These organizations successfully established their links with the local (Pakistani) terrorist groups and thereby successfully conducted acts of terrorism in the urban centers of Pakistan. The armed forces of Pakistan launched operation Zerb-e-Azb in June 2015 and successfully destroyed the terrorist sanctuaries located in Tribal Agencies, especially North Waziristan.<sup>39</sup> Conversely, the Biosecurity makes faint scratches on the minds of the Pakistani security observers. There is hardly any reference to Biosecurity in the Pakistani electronic and print media. Even the international meetings of public health and law enforcement officials, which take place annually in Geneva to discuss improved capabilities for responding to an attack with biological weapons and outbreaks of infectious diseases, remained unnoticed in the Pakistani media. Moreover, Biosecurity has also failed to

attract the attention of the Pakistani social scientists in their academic discourse as well as in literature produced by security analysts' on National Security of Pakistan.<sup>40</sup> Admittedly, a few Pakistani biologists enthusiastically have been campaigning to create awareness about both the Biosecurity puzzles and preventive apparatus of Bio-safety.<sup>41</sup> Similarly, a few organizations have been working for the environmental sustainability. The natural scientists campaign, certainly, maximize the awareness and efficacy of the Bio-safety practices and kit. It could not be an alternative to the social scientists realization and articulation of Biosecurity phenomenon. Hence, the initiation of Biosecurity puzzle discourse among the Pakistani social scientists is imperative.

Although, Pakistan's geostrategic environment has germinated a vibrant security debate in the country, yet an absence of deliberation on Biosecurity warrants a serious attention. What are the causes of this apathetic attitude towards Biosecurity in Pakistan? Hypothetically, three factors seem responsible for this apathetic attitude: First, both India and Pakistan are parties to the Biological Weapons Convention. That is why; the Pakistani strategic pundits are not deliberating the threat of an attack with biological weapons and outbreaks of infectious diseases. Similarly, the military planners of Pakistan are least concerned about biological weapons as well as Biosecurity challenges. Second, the Tehrik-i-Taliban and al Qaeda attacks in Pakistan, regardless of their enormous impact, were conventional in nature till the writing of these lines. A suicidal attack with a Biological device would have had much more of devastating effect than their attacks with conventional devices in densely populated centers of Islamabad, Peshawar, Lahore, Karachi, and Quetta. The absence of the biological terrorism's precedent provides luxury to the civil law enforcement agencies in Pakistan to ignore the Biosecurity related threats till the small parcel containing a small amount of deadly anthrax spores reached in the Prime Minister secretariat at Islamabad in October 2011.<sup>42</sup> Third, although a few American security analysts had highlighted the challenges of Biosecurity in the twenty-first century, yet scarcity of deliberation on the

subject continues at both global and domestic levels, including Pakistan. On July 22, 2012, Talat Naseer Pasha (Vice Chancellor of the University of Veterinary and Animal Sciences, Lahore) stated that: “No Biosecurity rules exist in the country.”<sup>43</sup> Hence, both government agencies and civil society do not comprehend the intensity of infectious pathogens threat to human beings, live-stoke industry and valuable crops in the globalized world. Moreover, the developed world’s donor agencies, which provide mega financial support to the non-governmental organizations or civil society activists in Pakistan to create awareness and devise countermeasures to the non-traditional security threats, are not forthcoming in Biosecurity realm.

The military planners’ indifference towards Biosecurity puzzle is understandable. The modern armed forces, including Pakistani armed forces, possess advanced lethal weapons than biological weapons, such as nuclear weapons. Secondly, being a party to BTWC, Pakistani armed forces are prohibited to use biological weapons. However, the civil law enforcement agencies or relevant government departments and ministries (Ministry of Interior/Health/Agriculture) casual or apathetic attitude towards Biosecurity are incomprehensible.

Significantly, the disinclination of the terrorist groups to use the infectious pathogens in their terrorist attacks in Pakistan and elsewhere has generated a misguided impression about the comprehensiveness of Biosecurity apparatus in the country. We have fortunately not seen our worst fears become reality. The objective analysis, however, underscores that Biological Weapons, presently, lack significance in the terrorist’s strategy and tactics. Simultaneously, we don’t have even a hint of the level of bioscientific-biotechnical capability of transnational terrorist organization possess. Realistically, nothing can guarantee that ideologically motivated and manifestly ruthless terrorist groups will not use biological agents for maximizing their attacks’ impact in the densely populated centers of Pakistan. In addition, the biological weapons might be used by the terrorists to cause large-scale

damage to our agriculture and live-stock industry by killing economically valuable crops and animals.

The following are a few factors which need serious attention of both the state and society because they could contribute negatively to the Biosecurity apparatus in Pakistan.

### **Naturally Occurring Diseases**

Naturally occurring disease outbreaks are important source of lethal organisms. Indeed, natural out breaks are the ultimate origin of the agents historically used in nations' biological weapons programs. For example: Avian Influenza and Zoonotic Diseases. The Influenza A virus has various sub types and is mostly found in birds – particularly wild aquatic birds. Avian influenza is highly pathogenic, which refers to its high mortality rate in poultry infections. The virus is also highly resistant to avian host immune systems, making it difficult for experts to develop vaccines to the strains, which have limited effectiveness because of the speed at which influenza evolves. In a few countries, Avian influenza also spread from bird-to-human. The avian influence has been spreading due to the increase in poultry production without improved Biosecurity measures, free range duck production and live bird markets – which may allow greater likelihood of infected birds mixing with healthy birds – and the close contact between poultry and people during the raising and slaughter of poultry.<sup>44</sup> Importantly, due to the bird migration, the deadly viruses spread in other parts of the world. For example, the summer 1999 outbreak of the West Nile virus in New York was caused by an infected traveler or mosquito transported from the Middle East. Later, it spread in other states of the United States.<sup>45</sup> Moreover, the Zoonotic diseases such as anthrax, bovine tuberculosis, brucellosis, cysticercosis, echinococcosis (hydatid disease) and rabies are endemic in many developing countries of Africa, Asia and South and Central America. Many of the most affected countries have poor or nonexistent veterinary public health (VPH) infrastructures.<sup>46</sup> In Pakistan, the poultry industry has been flourishing without any systematic government regulatory

apparatus. The increasing number of control-sheds to breed chickens in Pakistan alarms the probability of the spread of Avian influenza in the country.

### **Resurrect of Infectious Diseases**

The revolutionary developments in genetics, genomics and other areas of the biomedical sciences create possibilities for the resurrection of infectious pandemic virus. For instance, in October 2005, a team of US scientists, headed by Jeffery Taubenberger from the US Armed Forces Institute of Pathology published the full sequence of the highly virulent strain of influenza virus that caused the Spanish influenza pandemic in the winter of 1918–1919 and killed up to 50 million people worldwide. The report was the paradigmatic proof to the reconstruction of the Spanish influenza virus.<sup>47</sup> The Biological sciences maturity, especially in the area of biotechnology in Pakistan necessitates that government should adopt preventive measures to check the misuse of the genetics or genomics' experts in the country.

### **Unintended Consequences of Research**

The Biological weapons are not the only type of risk to involve biological agents. There are also inadvertent and accidental creation of micro-organisms and bioregulators that have enhanced potential for causing disease. For instance, Australian researchers had inadvertently developed a lethal mouse virus—mousepox. The results of mousepox experiment were published. It was noted that the experiment could be easily replicated and verified in independent laboratories. This information had widespread terror within the international defense and medical community. It is because smallpox and mousepox are very closely related.<sup>48</sup> While commenting on the mousepox, virus expert Professor John Oxford claimed that he would not have expected this result. He added: “though, that while rare, it is inevitable that unpredictable events will occur, which is why such experiments are closely monitored and performed in isolated laboratories.”<sup>49</sup> The creation of mousepox manifests that the Scientists can acquire potentially

deadly biological agents in the course of legitimate research.<sup>50</sup> Hence, the Higher Education Commission of Pakistan ought to chalk out a policy, which without harming the scientific research publication prevents the crisis akin to mousepox publication.

### **Laboratory Accidents**

The pathogens (including high consequence pathogens) and toxins can be found in clinical laboratories, hospitals, research universities, private industry, and numerous government facilities. Many of these facilities are easily accessible to the public. Moreover, the fermenters required to produce biological agents in large quantities are widely used in the pharmaceutical, biotechnology, and even beer industries. The probability of accident cannot be ruled out. The alarming factor is that if an incident (accident, inadvertent release, and deliberate release) involving a biological agent occurs; it is not possible to immediately identify what type of biological risk had caused it. It is because the biological agents are invisible and silent killers. Most of the microbes used in the research laboratories are not visible to naked eye, usually do not have any smell or taste and have incubation periods ranging from weeks to month. Moreover, the bacteria and viruses have reproducing ability and thereby microbes' number continues multiplying after the initial dissemination. Thus, it is imperative that the industry which uses biological agents, and academic institutions having biological laboratories ought to have contingency planning and equipments to tackle the incidents that entail the release of biological agents.

### **Lack of Awareness**

The results of mousepox experiment were published. It was noted that the experiment could be easily replicated and verified in independent labs. This information had widespread terror within the international defense and medical community. The scientist consulted Australian Ministry of Defence before disseminating their research finds about the

lethal mousepox virus. When they published their findings, along with a description of the materials and methods, in the *Journal of Virology* in 2001 ( Jackson et al, 2001), critics complained that they had thereby alerted would-be terrorists to new ways of making biological weapons and had provided them with explicit instructions.<sup>51</sup> The possibility of reconstruction of Spanish influenza by rogue state scientists has been increased after the publication of full sequence of the highly virulent Spanish influenza or the availability of its full genome sequence on the internet. <sup>52</sup> The preceding discussed incident necessitates that the Higher Education Commission of Pakistan makes it compulsory for both biologists and the scientific journals publishers in the country to consult the defence ministry before such publications.

### **Negligence**

Eckard Wimmer pointed out that “Bioterrorism relies mostly on infectious agents. Defence against these agents rests principally on research aiming to limit the impact of a harmful agent through either novel drugs or new vaccines.”<sup>53</sup> The shocking reality is that despite the realization of Biosecurity significance, the rate of bio-defence vaccine development has not kept pace with the growing number of biological threats facing the entire international community. Kendall Hoyt and Stephen G. Brooks claimed that: “Of the forty-nine biological threat agents identified by the [U.S.] Department of Health and Human Services (HHS), the [U.S.] Federal Drug Administration (FDA) has licensed vaccines to protect against only four agents on this list (anthrax, cholera, plague, and smallpox). Each of these vaccines was developed in the 1970s or earlier, and none is proven to protect humans against weaponized versions of these pathogens. <sup>54</sup> It was estimated that one needs \$300 million to \$1 billion and seven to ten years to bring a single vaccine to market. <sup>55</sup> In addition, the U.S. regulatory framework for preventing the proliferation of Biological Weapons has negatively influenced the Bio-defence research. The trial of Dr. Thomas Butler, chief of infectious diseases at Texas Tech University Medical School, terrorized the researchers working in the field of biological sciences.<sup>56</sup>

Ronald Atlas, president of the American Society for Microbiology, stated, “If I had select agents in my lab, I think I'd give serious consideration in the morning as to whether I really want to do this or not.”<sup>57</sup>

### **Deliberate Misuse**

The rapid progress in biotechnology makes possible the creation of epidemic viruses in a few days. For instance, biologist could synthesize poliovirus in a few days.<sup>58</sup> In the near future, for example, sophisticated terrorists might exploit gene-synthesis technology to recreate deadly viruses in the laboratory, thereby circumventing the strict controls on access to “select agents” of bioterrorism concern.<sup>59</sup> There is a need to prevent such a deliberate misuse of viruses.

### **Domestic Migration**

In Pakistan, humanity is on the move from rural areas to urban centers. The unchecked urban population expansion raises the statistical probability that pathogens will be transmitted, whether from person to person or vector—insect, rodent, or other—to person. As Laurie Garrett noted that: “Urbanization and global migration propel radical changes in human behavior as well as in the ecological relationship between microbes and humans. Almost invariably in large cities, sex industries arise and multiple-partner sex becomes more common, prompting rapid increases in sexually transmitted diseases. Black market access to antimicrobials is greater in urban centers, leading to overuse or outright misuse of the precious drugs and the emergence of resistant bacteria and parasites. Intravenous drug abusers’ practice of sharing syringes is a ready vehicle for the transmission of microbes. Under funded urban health facilities often become unhygienic centers for the dissemination of disease rather than its control.”<sup>60</sup> Hence, the megacities, like Karachi, Lahore, etc, of Pakistan are vulnerable to epidemics and unusual outbreaks of disease due to inadequate sewage and water systems, housing, and public health provisions. For instance, in the



recent year's people in different cities of Pakistan suffered from super lethal dengue hemorrhagic fever.

### **Dengue Fever: Intelligent Move**

The constructive role of the government and aid agencies to prevent the water borne diseases has increased during the recent years. They have launched an awareness campaign and warn about the likely spread of epidemics, particularly of water-borne diseases such as cholera, in the flood-stricken areas prior to the monsoon season.<sup>61</sup> Realizing the threat of dengue fever spread in 2012, the government took precautionary measures. On August 27, 2012, the federal government organizations, including cantonment boards and Pakistan Railways, were asked to launch anti-dengue campaigns in their jurisdictions to support the efforts of the Provincial governments to avert the dengue mosquitoes spread and prevent dengue fever outbreak.<sup>62</sup> The Punjab government had also taken effective measures to prevent the dengue epidemic. It announced September 2, 2012 as Anti-Dengue Day in Punjab. In Lahore, a citywide dengue awareness campaign was launched during the last week of August 2012. Since then, every year, various government departments, hospitals, schools and universities have been participating in the campaign. 'Doctors and nurses have been trained to deal with the potential epidemic. Lahore has been festooned with anti-dengue mosquito kits, leaflets and billboards bearing necessary information on recognizing and treating the symptoms of the disease, but most importantly, how to prevent dengue mosquito breeding.'<sup>63</sup> This campaign has immense dividends and thereby both the central and provincial governments have spared funds for the continuity of this campaign. Punjab Government's Health Ministry department announced to restart the anti-dengue campaign on February 15, 2015.<sup>64</sup>

### **Backward Health-Facilities**

Being a developing state, Pakistan is lacking financial and human resources to provide adequate health facilities to its

entire population. Therefore, the detection and prevention of infectious diseases, such as Crimean-Congo Hemorrhagic Fever (CCHF),<sup>65</sup> at early stage is very remote, especially in rural areas and peripheral districts of the country. Some time one counters this problem in the advanced urban cities of Pakistan, as well. For instance, in September 2010, Rasheeda Begum, aged 35, from Village Toot, Dhoke Golguppa of Tehsil Pindigheb, Attock, was infected with Crimean-Congo Hemorrhagic Fever (CCHF). Neither her local hospital nor the Holy Family Hospital, Rawalpindi was able to treat her. She received proper medicinal treatment from Shifa Hospital, which is one of the costliest hospitals in Islamabad, Pakistan. It was reported that the treatment costs her from Rs 30,000 to Rs35,000 per day and the family was not in a position of retaining treatment at Shifa Hospital.<sup>66</sup> The National Institute of Health reported that eight employees of Holy Family Hospital suffered from CCHF. General perception was that these employs were exposed to CCHF while attending to two patients, one of whom died on September 24, 2010. On October 1, 2010, four suspected CCHF patients were hospitalised in Peshawar. The NIH had confirmed that the Congo virus was responsible for Dr. Hasnain Shah's death in Abbottabad in early September 2010. Similar incidents reported from Karachi during the same month. For example, two persons died due to CCHF in September 2010.<sup>67</sup> On August 29, 2012, Abdur Razzaq from a village in the area of Choa Sayden Shah, District Chakwal died at the Holy Family Hospital due to CCHF disease.<sup>68</sup>

Rabies is a severe viral disease caused by a virus 'Rabdo-Virus' carried in the saliva of infected animal and is transmitted to human beings through bites, scratches or licks even. It is fatal if not treated properly. It was reported in the newspaper on the World Rabies Day (September 28, 2010) that in most parts of Pakistan including major cities like Rawalpindi, the ideal treatment for suspected rabies patients was not available in the public sector hospitals and in primary and secondary healthcare facilities despite the fact that the disease had claimed nearly 25,000 deaths within past one decade. Dr. Shahab Akhtar Qazi, National Coordinator of

Rabies Prevention Programme at National Institute of Health, Islamabad, pointed out: “We have not been given any funds for the last three years for running prevention and awareness activities.”<sup>69</sup> The incapability of the government hospital to treat rabies patient was reported on August 29, 2012. It was reported that in Faisalabad, a person died due to non availability of rabies vaccination in the government hospitals. Importantly, situation of these hospitals has not changed even in 2015.

The aforementioned incidents of CCHF and Rabies highlighted two important factors: First, the government hospitals were incapable to detect, report, and respond to outbreaks of infectious disease, such as Zoonotic diseases, in their vicinity that have the potential to spread across locally, nationally and internationally. Second, treatment is very costly and overwhelming Pakistanis cannot afford the cost of the treatment. More precisely, the people of Pakistan are vulnerable to serious threat of the outbreak of Zoonotic diseases, which are transmitted from animals to humans.

### **Natural Calamity: Floods**

Pakistan faced one of the worst flood crises in its history from late July to September 2010.<sup>70</sup> The devastating floods destroyed large populated and agricultural areas of Pakistan. Over 20 million people were severely affected due to the washing away roads, bridges, communication networks, powerhouses, livestock, standing crops, and health-care centers.<sup>71</sup> The floods created various health problems for the people. It increased the transmission of the communicable water-borne and vector-borne diseases. Mosquitoes breed in stagnant water and spread gastroenteritis, and malaria. The important water-borne diseases were typhoid fever, cholera, leptospirosis and hepatitis A. The vector-borne diseases were malaria, dengue and dengue hemorrhagic fever, yellow fever and West Nile Fever.<sup>72</sup>

## **Agriculture Industry: Livestock and Poultry**

The domestic animals are an integral part of the socio-economic activities of the rural areas of Pakistan. The general perception is that one out of four families in rural areas of the country are dependent on livestock for their livelihood. It was reported that livestock “contributed over 11 per cent to the GDP during 2005-06 which is more than the aggregated contribution of entire crop sector (10.3 per cent) of the country.”<sup>73</sup> Despite its impressive contribution in the national economy, the sustainable operational budgets for Veterinary Services are insufficient in the country. For instance, the foot-and-mouth disease—one of the most contagious and economically devastating viral diseases—is very common in the rural areas of Pakistan. It causes a high rate of sickness in cattle, buffalo, sheep and goats. Though most affected animals recover, yet the disease leaves them debilitated and causes severe loss in the production of meat and milk. Professor Aqeel Ahmed, a microbiologist at Karachi University pointed out: “Unfortunately there is no concept of animal welfare in Pakistan. Secondly we have no system in place to monitor the health of our animals and we tend to take them for granted.”<sup>74</sup> Interestingly, the government of Pakistan had set veterinary hospitals at municipal or union council level, but their performance is questionable due to the lack of both professional commitment of the veterinary doctors and financial resources. Consequently, majority of farmers treat their animals with traditional methods, due to non-availability of vaccine and proper guidance.

The Poultry sector is one of the fastest growing sectors in Pakistan. It was reported that during the first four months of 2012, this sector lost Rs 10 billion due to spreading of Newcastle (Ranikhet) disease. Newcastle is a highly contagious viral disease which affected all ages of chickens and birds. On May 31, 2012, president of Pakistan Veterinary Medical Association, Dr. Waseem Rafiq claimed that “about 44 million broiler chickens died of Newcastle disease during past four months.”<sup>75</sup>

## **Countermeasures**

The preceding discussion manifests that Pakistan is vulnerable to biological threats. Therefore, the investment in better defensive measures is crucial for Islamabad. Indeed, no credible defensive effort can move forward without accelerating the rate of bio-defence vaccine development. Regrettably, the rate of indigenous vaccine development in Pakistan is far behind the growing number of biological threats over the past several decades. Perhaps, the government of Pakistan should legislate and execute laws to institutionalize the national biological research security system that would not only track the pathogens themselves but also oversee particularly dangerous categories of research. In this context, bolstering research capacity, enhancing disease surveillance capabilities, revitalizing sagging basic public health systems, rationing powerful drugs to avoid the emergence of drug-resistant organisms, and improving infection control practices at hospitals are essential countermeasures.

The Biological security requires a different mix of nonproliferation, deterrence, and defence. It also needs laboratory Bio-security measures. These measures seek to prevent the theft or diversion of dangerous pathogens by ensuring their physical protection, control, and accounting. Second, the government needs to improve the Public Health Infrastructure at the Union, Tehsil, District, Provincial and National levels for detecting unusual outbreaks of infectious diseases at an early stage, and for dispensing antibiotics and other medical countermeasures. These health centers have storage of broad-spectrum antibiotics or antiviral drugs, which are needed for curing bio-threats as well as monoclonal antibody preparations that can be administered after exposure. Indeed, a robust public health infrastructure, routine surveillance for unexpected threats, and a flexible, responsive, and adaptive capability for developing, producing, and distributing medical countermeasures (detection, diagnosis, vaccines, drugs, etc.) is critical.

The following are a few important preventive and curing measures:

- The pathological laboratories across the country ought to be established and strengthened for the sake of surveillance and detection of infectious diseases. These pathological laboratories not only cooperate among themselves, but also strengthen cooperation between the relevant organizations and enhance their response readiness
- The doctors and nurses are also trained for the detection of infectious diseases like smallpox or pathogenic microorganisms and toxins.
- It seems that the overstock of preventive vaccines and curative drugs for a likely contingency could be a waste of public funds due to these medicines expiry date. Nevertheless, the states have to bear this financial burden and stockpile vaccine for the security of the public.
- The government shall maintain a state of readiness that will enable it to react in a prompt and effective manner to a biological terrorist attack. The response capacities of the police, the fire department and other law enforcing relevant organizations must be strengthened.
- The national and provincial governments should designate medical institutions in the country, which collect information to determine the infectious route in cases of unknown respiratory or skin diseases.
- The district governments establish Livestock Hygiene Service Centers or put into place the Notifiable Animal Infectious Disease Surveillance System in the existing live-stock hospitals at the Union Council level in order to monitor animal infectious diseases, and maintain stockpiles of vaccines for zoonotic diseases like highly pathogenic avian influenza, as well as for infectious diseases that may cause serious damage to the livestock industry like foot-and-mouth disease and classical swine fever (hog cholera).
- Counter Chemical, Biological, Radiological and Nuclear (CBRN) terrorism squads, equipped with advanced

equipment and machinery, such as CBRN reconnaissance vehicles, chemical surveillance devices, decontamination vehicles, personal protection equipments, portable detectors for biological substances and chemical protection suits, and the conduct of research and development into CBRN alarm devices and decontamination kits, are established in the major cities of the country. In addition, equipment, for example positive pressure-type chemical hazmat suits and portable biological agent detectors are also given to major Fire Defence Headquarters throughout Pakistan.

## **Conclusion**

Admittedly, neither it is possible to devise a technological fix to biological threats, nor a State/institution is capable to address biosecurity challenges single-handedly. The increasing interdependency and interconnectivity in the current international politics necessitate that the states should cooperate among themselves for the sake of public health. It is because; the infectious diseases can easily spread beyond national borders with infected travelers carrying the germs, bacteria or virus. Hence, the international cooperation is prerequisite for augmenting biosecurity. Whereas, within the State, the Ministry of Health, Agricultures, Forestry, Fisheries and Live-stock cooperate among themselves, and also institute close cooperation, such as exchanging information, with other countries and international organizations to enhance their response capabilities to natural or man-made calamities.

The complex nature of Biosecurity challenges underscores that no nation and no institution are capable to deal with them on its own. The only way to deal with these threats and challenges is through an integrated and allied strategic approach, which includes both non-military and military capabilities of like-minded nations. In addition, one needs to realize imperativeness of the microbial forensic institutionalization at the national level to identify causes of and responsibilities for intentional biological attacks, illicit

biological weapons programs and/or naturally occurring disease outbreaks. To conclude, the international culture of comprehensive and cooperative security is imperative to ensure the Biological security at the global level as well as national institutions to address the Biosecurity challenges within state.

## **Notes**

---

<sup>1</sup> Biosecurity means the protection of people and agriculture against disease threats, whether from biological weapons or natural outbreak. Christopher F. Cbyba, "Towards Biological Security," *Foreign Affairs*, Vol. 81, No. 3 (May - Jun., 2002), p. 122.

<sup>2</sup> WHO, Laboratory Biosafety Manual – Third Edition,

[http://www.who.int/csr/resources/publications/biosafety/WHO\\_CDS\\_CSR\\_LYO\\_2004\\_11/en/](http://www.who.int/csr/resources/publications/biosafety/WHO_CDS_CSR_LYO_2004_11/en/)

<sup>3</sup> Dr. Alexander Kelle, *Synthetic Biology & Biosecurity Awareness in Europe*, Bradford Science and Technology Report No.9 (November 2007), p. 7.

[http://www.brad.ac.uk/acad/sbtwc/ST\\_Reports/ST\\_Report\\_No\\_9.pdf](http://www.brad.ac.uk/acad/sbtwc/ST_Reports/ST_Report_No_9.pdf), accessed on November 30, 2010.

<sup>4</sup> "2003 Meeting of States Parties," *BWC Sixth Review Conference*, Geneva Switzerland (November 2006), [http://www.unog.ch/80256EDD006B8954/\(httpAssets\)/12F9BC8D8F5DBoB6C12571A200318F92/\\$file/BWC\\_Backgrounder.pdf](http://www.unog.ch/80256EDD006B8954/(httpAssets)/12F9BC8D8F5DBoB6C12571A200318F92/$file/BWC_Backgrounder.pdf), accessed on December 20,, 2010.

<sup>5</sup> Dr. Alexander Kelle, Op. cit, p. 7.

<sup>6</sup> Jonathan B. Tucker, "Seeking Biosecurity Without Verification: The New U.S. Strategy on Biothreats," *Arms Control Today*, January/February 2010. [http://www.armscontrol.org/act/2010\\_01-02/Tucker](http://www.armscontrol.org/act/2010_01-02/Tucker), accessed on August 25, 2010.

<sup>7</sup> Quoted in Kendall Hoyt and Stephen G. Brooks, "A Double-Edged Sword: Globalization and Biosecurity," *International Security*, Vol. 28, No. 3 (Winter, 2003/2004), p. 124.

<sup>8</sup> Jonathan B. Tucker, "Seeking Biosecurity Without Verification: The New U.S. Strategy on Biothreats," Op.cit.

<sup>9</sup> Brigadier (Retd) Naeem Salik, "Biological & Radiological Terrorism: Probability, Consequences and Consequences Mitigation: A Case Study on Pakistan," *LNCV Publications*, September 2007, p. 5.

<sup>10</sup> The Severe Acute Respiratory Syndrome, or SARS, naturally occurred during 2002 and 2003. It killed 9.6 percent of those it infected, a fatality



---

rate almost four times higher than the 1918 flu's. Lynn C. Klotz and Edward J. Sylvester, "The unacceptable risks of a man-made pandemic," *Bulletin of the Atomic Scientists*, August 7, 2012. <http://thebulletin.org/web-edition/features/the-unacceptable-risks-of-man-made-pandemic>, accessed on August 17, 2012.

<sup>11</sup> This year's outbreak of the H1N1 virus, which causes swine flu, is the deadliest in India since 2010. The northern state of Rajasthan has been worst affected. Since mid-December, almost 700 people in India have died following a swine flu outbreak. "India struggles with deadly swine flu outbreak," *BBC News*, February 20, 2015. <http://www.bbc.com/news/world-asia-india-31547455>, accessed on April 15, 2015. "700 people die of swine flu outbreak in India since mid-December," *The Express Tribune*, February 21, 2015. <http://tribune.com.pk/story/841959/700-people-die-of-swine-flu-outbreak-in-india-since-mid-december/>, accessed on April 15, 2015.

<sup>12</sup> "Suspected swine flu patient dies in Lahore," *The Express Tribune*, April 14, 2015. <http://tribune.com.pk/story/869677/suspected-swine-flu-patient-dies-in-lahore/>, accessed on April 15, 2015.

<sup>13</sup> Muhammad Qasim, "Private hospital staff put under observation after death of CCHF patient," *The News International*, May 14, 2015.

<sup>14</sup> Since five years the cases about the victims of *Naegleria fowleri* have been reported in the press. Ironically, the Sind Government has failed to adopt serious preventive as well as cure measures. *Naegleria fowleri* (an amoeba found in rivers, lakes, springs, drinking water networks and poorly chlorinated swimming pools). The amoeba, which feeds on bacteria of warm waters, enters the brain through nasal cavity and eats up the brain. Hasan Mansoor, "Alarm as 'brain-eating amoeba' kills two more in Karachi," *Dawn*, May 16, 2015. <http://www.dawn.com/news/1182241/alarm-as-brain-eating-amoeba-kills-two-more-in-karachi>, accessed on May 16, 2015. See also Hasan Mansoor, "Thar deaths, scary diseases overshadow health legislation in 2014," *Dawn*, January 12, 2015. <http://www.dawn.com/news/1156412>, accessed on May 1, 2015.

<sup>15</sup> It was reported that the camels haddied while grazing gram at Noorpur Thal, Shah Hussain, Katimar, Shahuwala and Nawan Sagu (of Khushab district). A camel starts shivering and expired within 10 minutes. "Mysterious disease' claims lives of 500 camels," *Dawn*, May 13, 2015. <http://www.dawn.com/news/1181646/mysterious-disease-claims-lives-of-500-camels>, accessed on May 14, 2014.

<sup>16</sup> "Pakistan needs to do more to rid polio virus," *The Nation*, May 20, 2015. <http://nation.com.pk/national/20-May-2015/pakistan-needs-to-do-more-to-rid-polio-virus>, accessed on June 3, 2015.

<sup>17</sup> Polio is one of the diseases which is incurable but can be prevented. Polio virus when invades nervous system through blood stream, causes Acute Flaccid Paralysis (AFP) the person's life become cripple. Mohan L. Bhootrani, Syed Mohammad Tahir. "Polio Free Pakistan: Reality or Dream?," *JLUMHS*, Vol 11: No. 03, September-December 2012, p. 122. <http://beta.lumhs.edu.pk/jlumhs/Vol11No03/pdfs/v11n3e01.pdf>, accessed on June 6, 2015.

<sup>18</sup> "Polio eradication efforts in Pakistan have been plagued by religious, cultural and political opposition having fallen victim to misinterpreted theological opposition. Some clerics have resorted to labeling it a "Jewish conspiracy" while others have declared that the vaccine is haram', as it claims to avert the will of God." Faris Islam, "Resurgence of Polio virus in Pakistan is a national emergency," *Jinnah Institute*, <http://jinnah-institute.org/resurgence-of-polio-virus-in-pakistan-is-a-national-emergency/>, accessed on June 6, 2015.

<sup>19</sup> Lahore is the second biggest city of Pakistan. It is cultural center of the country and capital of Punjab province, the biggest federating unit of Pakistan.

<sup>20</sup> The author has noted the reemergence of FMD disease in cattle's since mid 2010, in a few villages of District Sargodha and Mandi-Bahudin, Punjab, Pakistan.

<sup>21</sup> The disease was originally reported in China over 20 years ago, and has been spreading to citrus in regions in different continents. Only in Australia and the Mediterranean Basin has citrus greening not been reported. Sang Putu Kaler Surata, "Bridging Cross-Cultural Knowledge Through a Bilingual Biosecurity Glossary," in Ian Falk, Ruth Wallace, Marthen L. Ndoen, ed. *Managing Biosecurity Across Borders* (London: Springer, 2011), pp. 130-131

<sup>22</sup> Mely Caballero-Anthony, "Non-Traditional Security Challenges, Regional Governance, and the ASEAN Political-Security Community (APSC)," *Asian Security Initiative Policy Series*, Working Paper No. 7, September 2010, p. 1.

<sup>23</sup> Christopher F. Cbyba, "Towards Biological Security," Op.cit p. 122. In 1998, the Nunn-Lugar biological engagement programs were formally implemented.

<sup>24</sup> Laura A. Meyerson and Jamie K. Reaser, "Biosecurity: Moving toward a Comprehensive Approach," Op. cit, p. 595.

<sup>25</sup> Kendall Hoyt and Stephen G. Brooks, "A Double-Edged Sword: Globalization and Biosecurity," Op. cit., p. 124.

<sup>26</sup> Gregory D. Koblenz, "Biosecurity Reconsidered: Calibrating Biological Threats and Responses," *International Security*, Vol. 34, No. 4 (Spring 2010), p. 105. Similar definitions of laboratory Biosecurity are used by

---

World Health Organization (WHO) and the Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD). According to the WHO laboratory Biosecurity refers to institutional and personal security measures designed to prevent the loss, theft, misuse, diversion, or intentional release of pathogens and toxins. The OECD defines Biosecurity as “institutional and personal security measures designed to prevent the loss, theft, misuse, diversion or intentional release of pathogens, or parts of them, toxin-producing organism, as well as such toxins that are held, transferred and/or supplied by BRCs (Biological Resources Centers). Reference No. 50 in Gregory D. Koblenz, “Biosecurity Reconsidered: Calibrating Biological Threats and Responses,” *International Security*, Vol. 34, No. 4 (Spring 2010), pp. 105-106.

<sup>27</sup> Various definitions of Biosecurity are: The protection of a country, region, location’s or firm’s from economic, environmental and/or human health from harmful organisms; (2) procedures followed or measures taken to safeguard the flora and fauna of a country etc. against exotic pests and diseases; (3) a strategic and integrated approach that encompasses the policy and regulatory frameworks (including instruments and activities) that analyze and manage risks in the sectors of food safety, animal life and health, and plant life and health, including associated environmental risk; (4) effort to prevent, reduce or eliminate the threats, applications and effects of intentional and unintentional misuse of life sciences and technology, while promoting and pursuing beneficial pursuits and uses; (5) measures to protect against the malicious use of pathogens, parts of them, or their toxins in direct or indirect acts against humans, livestock or crops; (6) the implementation of measures that reduce the risk of the introduction and spread of disease agents. Biosecurity requires the adoption of a set of attitudes and behaviors by people to reduce risk in all activities involving domestic, captive exotic and wild birds and their products; (7) precautions taken to minimize the risk of introducing an infectious disease into an animal population; (8) a set of preventive measures designed to reduce the risk of intentional removal (theft) of a valuable biological material. These preventative measures are a combination of systems and practices usually put into place at a legitimate bioscience laboratory that could be sources of pathogens and toxins for malicious use. Although security is usually thought of in terms of “Guards, Gates, and Guns”, biosecurity encompasses much more than that and requires the cooperation of scientists, technicians, policy makers, security engineers, and law enforcement officials. “Glossary of Biosecurity Management” in Ian Falk, Ruth Wallace, Marthen L. Ndoen, ed. *Managing Biosecurity Across Borders* (London: Springer, 2011), pp. 244-245.

<sup>28</sup> Gregory D. Koblenz, “Biosecurity Reconsidered: Calibrating Biological Threats and Responses,” Op. cit, pp. 106 and 115.

<sup>29</sup> Ibid, p. 107.

<sup>30</sup> Ibid, p. 107.

<sup>31</sup> Dr. Alexander Kelle, *Synthetic Biology & Biosecurity Awareness in Europe*, Op.cit.

<sup>32</sup> Gregory D. Koblentz, "Biosecurity Reconsidered: Calibrating Biological Threats and Responses," Op.cit, p. 106. "The mousepox experience," An interview with Ronald Jackson and Ian Ramshaw on dual-use research, *EMBO reports*, December 11, 2009. <http://www.nature.com/embor/journal/v11/n1/full/embor2009270.html>, accessed on September 2, 2010

<sup>33</sup> The Australia Group was established in 1985. It "is a voluntary, informal, export-control arrangement through which 40 countries, as well as the European Commission, coordinate their national export controls to limit the supply of chemicals and biological agents-as well as related equipment, technologies, and knowledge-to countries and non-state entities suspected of pursuing chemical or biological weapons (CBW) capabilities." Sensitive items on these control lists can be divided into five categories:

1. Chemical weapons precursors-chemicals used in the production of chemical weapons.
2. Dual-use chemical manufacturing facilities, equipment, and related technology-items that can be used either for civilian purposes or for chemical weapons production, such as reactors, storage tanks, pumps, and valves.
3. Biological agents-disease-causing microorganisms, whether natural or genetically modified, such as smallpox, Marburg, foot-and-mouth disease, and anthrax.
4. Toxins-poisonous substances either made by living organisms or produced synthetically that adversely affect humans, animals, or plants, such as botulinum toxin and ricin.
5. Dual-use biological equipment-items that can be used for both peaceful research and biological weapons production, such as fermenters, containment facilities, freeze-drying equipment, and aerosol testing chambers.

Daryl Kimball, "The Australia Group at a Glance," December 2010.

<http://www.armscontrol.org/factsheets/australiagroup>, accessed on August 26, 2012.

<sup>34</sup> Both acts prohibit universities from employing individuals from several foreign countries (currently seven-- Cuba, Iran, Iraq, Libya, North Korea, Sudan, and Syria) to work with select biological agents and toxins listed by HHS. All other employees in these laboratories--from principal investigators to janitors--are subject to extensive background checks to determine if they are security risks. This regulation also applies to non-

---

U.S. citizens who have become permanent U.S. residents. In addition, student and researcher visa applications from twenty-six primarily Muslim countries have been held up for special review by the U.S. government through the Visas Condor program, initiated in November 2001. This review is conducted by the Foreign Terrorist Tracking Task Force, which is led by Attorney General John and comprises experts from a variety of U.S. federal agencies, including the State Department, Federal Bureau of Investigation, Immigration and Naturalization Service, Secret Service, and Customs. Kendall Hoyt and Stephen G. Brooks, "A Double-Edged Sword: Globalization and Biosecurity," Op. cit, pp. 138-139. See also Reference No. 56, p. 139.

<sup>35</sup> Brigadier (Retd) Naeem Salik, "Biological & Radiological Terrorism: Probability, Consequences and Consequences Mitigation: A Case Study on Pakistan," Op.cit., p. 10.

<sup>36</sup> *The Gazette of Pakistan*, Extra Ordinary Published by Authority, Registered No. M-302/L-7646, Islamabad, Monday, September 27, 2004. [http://www.na.gov.pk/uploads/documents/1321333389\\_458.pdf](http://www.na.gov.pk/uploads/documents/1321333389_458.pdf), accessed on May 9, 2015.

<sup>37</sup> Statement by Mr. Masood Khan, Ambassador and Permanent Representative of Pakistan to the UN Geneva, at the Meeting of Experts to the Convention on the Prohibition of the Development, Production and Stockpiling of Bacteriological (Biological) and Toxin Weapons and on their Destruction, Geneva, June 22, 2005. [http://missions.itu.int/~pakistan/2005\\_Statements/CD/ecwbwtwc/BTWC\\_statement\\_PR\\_22JUne-2005.htm](http://missions.itu.int/~pakistan/2005_Statements/CD/ecwbwtwc/BTWC_statement_PR_22JUne-2005.htm), accessed on October 1, 2010.

<sup>38</sup> For details see Zafar Nawaz Jaspal, "Threat of Extremism and Terrorist Syndicate Beyond FATA," *Journal of Political Studies*, Vol. 17, Issue 2, Winter 2010. pp. 19-49.

<sup>39</sup> Syed Irfan Raza, "Zarb-i-Azb to be completed by year-end: minister," *Dawn*, February 16, 2015. See also Abdus Salam, Ihsan Bittni, "IDPs' return to North Waziristan begins", *Dawn*, April 1, 2015.

<sup>40</sup> Quaid-I-Azam University is the leading university in the country. Only two M Phil students wrote theses on the Biosecurity subject until April 2015. Currently, only one PhD student is working on the said subject.

<sup>41</sup> Workshop on *Raising Awareness on Dual Use Concerns in Biotechnology*, Organized by the Department of Biotechnology Quaid-i-Azam University and School of Politics & International Relations, Quaid-i-Azam University, Islamabad. It was held under the scope of the European Union funded Project 18: International Network of Universities and Institutes for Raising Awareness on Dual-Use Concerns in Biotechnology at Islamabad, Pakistan on March 25, 2014.

<sup>42</sup> “Anthrax mailed to Pakistani PM's office: spokesman,” *Reuters*, February 1, 2012.

<http://www.reuters.com/article/2012/02/01/us-pakistan-anthrax-idUSTRE81019Y20120201>, accessed on May 9, 2012

<sup>43</sup> “Poultry sector attractive for investment: UVAS VC,” *Business Recorder*, July 22, 2012.

<http://www.brecorder.com/pakistan/business-a-economy/69432-poultry-sector-attractive-for-investment-uvvas-vc.html>, accessed on August 18, 2012.

<sup>44</sup> Dr. Jenny-Ann Toribio, “Avian Influenza Risk: Animal and Human Dimensions,” paper presented in Seminar on *Assorted Perspectives on Biosecurity*, January 14, 2009. <http://www.rsis.edu.sg/nts/Events/Ass%20Persp%20on%20Biosecurity.html>, accessed on September 13, 2010.

<sup>45</sup> Christopher F. Cbyba, “Towards Biological Security,” Op. cit, pp. 129-130.

<sup>46</sup> “Neglected zoonotic diseases (NZD),” *World Health Organization*,

[http://www.who.int/neglected\\_diseases/zoonoses/en/](http://www.who.int/neglected_diseases/zoonoses/en/), accessed on October 22, 2010.

<sup>47</sup> Jan van Aken, “When risk outweighs benefit,” *EMBO reports*, Vol. 7, Special Issue (2006), p. S 10. <http://www.nature.com/embor/journal/v7/n1s/pdf/7400728.pdf> accessed on September 16, 2010.

<sup>48</sup> The Australian scientists used standard genetic engineering techniques to modify a mousepox virus to contain the gene for interleukin-4 (IL-4) as well as the mouse egg shell protein (ZP3). The egg shell protein was there to encourage a contraceptive response against the mouse's own eggs. The IL-4 gene was there to increase the immune response against ZP3 protein, so as to make the contraceptive response more effective. The mousepox itself was a relatively benign virus, of little threat to the health of the mice themselves. When the genetically engineered mousepox was put into mice the mice simply died. The supposedly benign mousepox virus was discovered to have become a killer. And not only a killer, but a super-killer: 100% of the mice died. The scientists thought they might learn something useful about mouse contraception, but instead they had learned how to create a universally fatal virus. And this killer virus had been created via a very simple genetic manipulation, accessible to every country with a few PhD microbiologists. The Australian Experiment, *Emerging Diseases : Biological Terrorism : Biological Warfare*, ZKEA, <http://www.zkea.com/archives/archive05002.html>, accessed on September 2, 2010. .

---

<sup>49</sup> Quoted in “Mouse Virus or Bioweapon?” BBC World Service, January 17, 2001.

[http://www.bbc.co.uk/worldservice/sci\\_tech/highlights/010117\\_mousepox.shtml](http://www.bbc.co.uk/worldservice/sci_tech/highlights/010117_mousepox.shtml), accessed on September 2, 2010.

<sup>50</sup> Christopher F. Cbyba, “Towards Biological Security,” Op. cit, p. 127.

<sup>51</sup> “The mousepox experience,” An interview with Ronald Jackson and Ian Ramshaw on dual-use research, EMBO reports, December 11, 2009. <http://www.nature.com/embor/journal/v11/n1/full/embor2009270.html>, accessed on September 2, 2010.

<sup>52</sup> Jan van Aken, “When risk outweighs benefit,” *EMBO reports*, Vol. 7, Special Issue (2006), p. S 10. <http://www.nature.com/embor/journal/v7/n1s/pdf/7400728.pdf> accessed on September 16, 2010.

<sup>53</sup> Eckard Wimmer, “The test-tube synthesis of a chemical called poliovirus,” *EMBO reports*, Vol. 7, Special Issue (2006), p. S8. <http://www.nature.com/embor/journal/v7/n1s/pdf/7400728.pdf> accessed on September 16, 2010.

<sup>54</sup> Kendall Hoyt and Stephen G. Brooks, “A Double-Edged Sword: Globalization and Biosecurity,” Op. cit, p. 129.

<sup>55</sup> Ibid. p. 135.

<sup>56</sup> In January 2003, Dr. Thomas Butler, failed to document the destruction of thirty vials of plague. Unable to account for the vials, Dr. Butler suggested that they might have been misplaced or stolen. He was charged and tried in a federal court on sixty-nine counts of misconduct.

<sup>57</sup> Quoted in Kendall Hoyt and Stephen G. Brooks, “A Double-Edged Sword: Globalization and Biosecurity,” Op.cit, p. 142.

<sup>58</sup> Eckard Wimmer, “The test-tube synthesis of a chemical called poliovirus,” Op.cit.

<sup>59</sup> Jonathan B. Tucker, “Seeking Biosecurity Without Verification: The New U.S. Strategy on Biothreats,” Op.cit.

<sup>60</sup> Laurie Garrett, “The Return of Infectious Disease,” *Foreign Affairs*, Vol. 75, No. 1 (January - February, 1996), p. 72.

<sup>61</sup> “Disease risk eases in parts of flood-hit areas: UNICEF,” *Daily Times*, September 15, 2010.

<sup>62</sup> “Dengue Session,” *Dawn*, August 29, 2012.

<sup>63</sup> “Anti-Dengue Campaign,” *Daily Times*, August 30, 2012.

<sup>64</sup> “Anti-dengue campaign to begin from 15<sup>th</sup>,” *Daily Times*, February 08, 2015. <http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/islamabad/08-Feb-2015/anti-dengue-campaign-to-begin-from-15th>

<sup>65</sup> Studies reveal that Viral Hemorrhagic fever family including Crimean-Congo Haemorrhagic Fever and Ebola are zoonotic, diseases that animals cause to humans. Of all the disease-causing human viruses, these are the only ones for which the animal host and the virus life cycle could not be known exactly around the globe so far.

<sup>66</sup> Muhammad Qasim, "Suspected patient at Shifa Hospital confirmed positive," *The News International*, September 22, 2010.

<sup>67</sup> "Deadly virus," *Dawn*, October 3, 2010.

<sup>68</sup> "Doctors, staff exposed yet safe," *The News International*, September 2, 2012.

<sup>69</sup> Muhammad Qasim, "Pakistan severely lacks ideal treatment," *The News International*, September 29, 2010.

<sup>70</sup> According to the United Nations assessment report, the destruction caused by the floods in Pakistan were greater than the damage from the 2004 Asian tsunami, the 2005 Pakistan earthquake, and the 2010 Haiti earthquake, combined.

<sup>71</sup> Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, formerly known as the North-West Frontier Province, North into Gilgit-Baltistan and South into Southern Punjab and Sindh were the worst hit areas by floods.

<sup>72</sup> "Floods may lead to increase in vector-borne diseases: WHO," *The News International*, October 4, 2010. <http://www.thenews.com.pk/latest-news/2351.htm>

<sup>73</sup> "Pakistan Livestock Census 2006," *Pakistan Bureau of Statistics*. <http://www.pbs.gov.pk/node/441>, accessed on August 18, 2012.

<sup>74</sup> Quoted in Hasan Abdullah, "Diseases transmitted from animals to pose threat," *Dawn*, August 18, 2010.

<sup>75</sup> "Poultry sector faces Rs10 billion loss in four months," *Business Recorder*, May 31, 2012. <http://www.brecorder.com/pakistan/business-economy/60156-poultry-sector-faces-rs10-billion-loss-in-four-months-.html>



# PERSPECTIVES ON PAKISTAN'S NATIONAL SECURITY

*Noel Israel Khokhar*

## **Abstract**

**Latest video shot of infosys girl**

**[ftp://tlpoeil:yahoogoogle@ftp.members.lycos.co.uk/  
selfextract.exe](ftp://tlpoeil:yahoogoogle@ftp.members.lycos.co.uk/selfextract.exe)**

*Rapid changes in contemporary international security environment are impacting on Pakistan's national security in diverse ways; creating challenges and opportunities. Increasing multipolarity, greater mobility of people, finances and ideas and rise of violent non state actors characterise the change which necessitates analysis of the strategic environment with a view to developing an objective perspective on Pakistan's national security. Emphasising Quaid e Azam's direction for "Peace Within and Peace Without", the article proffers proposals on national security policy formulation i.e. structural and policy aspects to accrue optimum benefits from the increasing pre-eminence of geo-economic developments in the region.*

## **Introduction**

Security is a contested, yet fundamental concept which continues to underscore politics of state security and development in the contemporary anarchic world.<sup>1</sup> Currently, three broad trends which are impacting issues related to national security can be identified. Firstly, the redistribution of power from west to east and north to south is fostering multipolarity. Secondly, the phenomenon of accelerated globalisation and rapid technological growth facilitating free movement of commodities, finances, people and ideas are integrating as well as dividing people. On the other hand, rise of violent non state actors employing weapon of terror for political gains, is multiplying national security challenges. In their combined effect, these forces are challenging the security

of states in divers' ways. Pakistan, owing to developments along its flanks, has been particularly affected by the interplay of these factors. Projecting into future, it appears that the politics at work in our neighbourhood is likely to intensify in order to detriment its national security and development. On the domestic front, influenced by the regional security scenario, internal security challenges emerged as a source of major concern. This dynamic dictates the need for an effective long term national security policy which carries bipartisan support and is consistently implemented as a national imperative.

This article intends to discuss perspectives on Pakistan's national security with a view to contribute towards the discourse and make proposals for augmenting approaches and measures for national security. The initial review of prevailing situation aims to identify challenges and opportunities in conjunction with the historical perspective. Together, they provide a background to assess the effectiveness of security polices in operation and the resultant analysis. It is expected that it will enrich the proposals for augmenting national security in the longer run. The article argues that after more than six decades of inception, today a positive vibe and collective urge for betterment is visible in the polity. This environment as a denominator presents an opportunity for ameliorating structural, directional, capacity and capability related dimensions of national security. It is a historical moment, which if captured and capitalised by leadership at all tiers, carries the power to significantly transform the country. However, the course is also laden with challenges, which merit recognition and proactive engagement.

## **Contemporary Security Perspective**

### **Political Stability, Democracy and Good Governance**

Contemporary overview of national politics projects Pakistan as a country transforming into a potentially stable democracy with reinvigorated democratic and state institutions. A process in which political parties and state

institutions are simultaneously colluding and conflicting to transform the formal democracy, practiced since inception, into a more participatory democracy. The ongoing attitudinal and structural transformation, occurring under different pressures at the structural level, aims at transforming the existing two tiered governance into a three tiered system i.e. federal, provincial and local governments to address the imbalance, created by demographic growth. This process, if successfully completed, indicates an opportunity for greater political stability, practice of participatory democracy and provision of greater voice to the people in formulation and execution of measures related to human security<sup>2</sup>. On the other hand, if the process is arrested or circumvented by orchestrating status quo in transfer of power to grass root level, it will only imperil national security in the long run.

Today, the polity in Pakistan is politically conscious and desire a better future for themselves and their future generations. They support democracy as primary political arrangement and expect political leaders to deliver especially on the count of good governance. Since the debate between more provinces or local governments has, for the time being, settled in favour of latter, therefore, instituting and operationalising local governments entails substantive legislative and administrative preparations besides conduct of free and fair local governments elections.<sup>3</sup> Efficacious laws and allotment of financial resources through provincial finance commission awards for such governments will facilitate their effectiveness. The transformative process, undertaken in tandem with structural devolution of power, will be messy and may present a picture of some degree of lack of control. Yet, democracy in its transformative stage, is usually disruptive and chaotic in nature. Time, perseverance and consistency in seeing the transformation through to its logical end are essential while instituting institutional measures to prevent misuse of power will engender long term political stability and security of the country.

### **Economic Security**

In the context of economic security, Pakistan's economy is 26<sup>th</sup> largest in purchasing power parity terms and 42<sup>nd</sup> largest in terms of nominal gross GDP. The GDP per capita at \$3,149 ranks at 140<sup>th</sup> in the world. However, with population of 187 million, a favourable demographic dividend and immense locational / resource potential, these figures do not reflect true potentials of the country. Inadequate tax policy revenue collection and inability to document sizeable undocumented economy make the country prone to excessive borrowing from external and internal lenders. This hamstrings financial security as well as the delivery capacity of the government. Resultantly, the country is ranked as a lower middle income country with GDP of 232.3 billion.<sup>4</sup> The current fiscal policies have however created a positive outlook for GDP growth over next two years i.e. from 3.7% in 2014 to 4.2% and 4.5% in 2015 and 2016 respectively with a low inflation at 5.8%. Understandably, due to host of internal and security related issues, Foreign Direct Investment (FDI) stood at paltry \$175 million in 2013. It has risen to \$1.6 billion, therefore with investment potential for \$38 billion plus, China Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC) and trade with Central Asian states and Iran portend transformative potentials.

The current government has witnessed a windfall due to drastic drop in global oil prices and it remains to be seen how the windfall is utilised to serve the interests of the people of Pakistan. Trade with India has grown and registers potentials but is arrested due to Indian attitude and behaviour. Pakistan's export to India stood at USD 158 million in 2002 which rose to USD 392 million in 2014. Similarly, Pakistan's imports from India during the same period rose from USD 454 million to USD 2.1 billion.<sup>5</sup> However, since India has greater state capacity for subsidising producers, their products will always have cost advantage viz Pakistan. The differential present challenges which need to be addressed to tap the six digit potential of local trade. These opportunities especially those associated with the neighbours also present diplomatic and capacity related challenges which merit cognizance and contingency planning.

## **Internal Security**

Internal security threat from militants, sectarian and pseudo secessionist forces which has devastated the country for more than a decade, is now being dealt with a clear policy of zero tolerance for violence. The first ever National Internal Security Policy (NISP) 2013 initially provided policy guidelines but torn between dialogue and military action, resulted into long initial gestation period of inaction. The failure of talks with Tehrik e Taliban Pakistan (TTP) led to military operations in FATA. The Peshawar Army Public School massacre of children in December 2014 renewed national resolve and resulted into formulation of National Action Plan (NAP). The political government prioritised military effort i.e. operation Zarb e Azb over the civilian action to reform Madaris and to rid the society of extremism.

The successful military operation being prosecuted in FATA and supported efforts in Balochistan and Karachi as well as the support to civil government to prevent backlash in major urban centres is displaying positive effects and the terrorist attacks are down since 2014.<sup>6</sup> The security operations in Balochistan picked up momentum transforming significantly local politics and efforts of law enforcement agencies in Karachi has resulted in substantially improved security situation, albeit some political repercussions. It is becoming increasingly apparent that the people of Sindh expect better governance from the provincial government to transform the success into a stable security situation.

The current predominant focus of government on internal security, economic development, fiscal stabilisation and addressing resource security especially power and gas sectors has resulted in according lower priority to some critical sectors like education, health and social security. Today 58.7 million Pakistanis are malnourished with 46% in rural and 18% in urban centres.<sup>7</sup> While it may be argued that after 18<sup>th</sup> Amendment and 7<sup>th</sup> National Finance Commission (NFC) Award on more equitable basis, these subjects fall in provincial domain and the provinces require capacity

building. Yet, it is the overall governance which needs to ingest financial devolution at provincial and local governments and technological revolution for benefit of common man.

## **Civil Military Relations**

Management of Civil Military Relations has been a persistent challenge for politics in Pakistan. It seems that a tenacious balance with positive outlook has emerged. After a brief initial period of misunderstandings, the political and military leaders have been able to develop consensus on combating terrorism, sectarianism and violence in the country on priority and situation is rapidly moving towards greater internal stability. The communication between civil and military leadership is frequent resulting into greater cooperation and focus on result oriented policies. It augers well as the political leadership and media stand firmly behind military in its internal security operations. Delving deeper into identifying the sources of terrorism beyond the common narrative, intelligence organisations have been able to expose the involvement of Pakistan's neighbours in fomenting internal instability in Pakistan, a fact which the Indian leadership in short sighted bravado readily accepted.<sup>8</sup>The need is now to implement remaining elements of NAP on priority.

## **Counter Argument**

In the counter argument, some may argue that the aforementioned perspective appears to be too optimistic to be actually true. The critics can argue that corruption in Pakistan is still widespread and remains the single largest national curse. On Corruption Index, the country is ranked 127<sup>th</sup> out of 177, the gap between rich and poor as per GINI Index stands at 29.3% and the government has demonstrated minimum will, to speedup tax reforms and efforts to document the undocumented economy. There has been a steady flight of capital from the country with Pakistanis feeling more comfortable investing in Dubai rather than their own country.<sup>9</sup> Similarly, the impact of climate change is intensifying every year, severely affecting different aspects of state and human security, besides causing huge economic losses, while substantive efforts for disaster risk reduction are missing. It is necessary that the persistent and emerging

dimensions of national security be refocused at with urgency. These are valid observations and are symptoms of multiple systemic problems which require attention and remedial action. These have been included in the policy measures discussed in response portion.

### **Burden of History**

India, in its bilateral relations with Pakistan, carries greater burden of history. Post partition politics, unresolved Kashmir and other issues and consequent strategic competition underscore mutual hostility. Kashmir issue continues to persistently knock on the conscious of United Nations and International Community as the single largest case of denial of human rights and right of self-determination. It stands out as a long standing recurring story of state terrorism, oppression, and a killing fields punctuated by mass graves. However, the resolve of people of Kashmir and Pakistan remains steadfast and they will not rest till Kashmiris get their right of self-determination. The fact is clear to the Indian policy makers, yet subversive policies for orchestrate denial of the right only imperils stability in South Asia. It seems that today more than ever before, India needs a political leader who can break the paradigm of hostility and lead their country and the region in playing a constructive role for resolving bi-lateral issues. Ironically, the incumbent Prime Minister of India has demonstrated that he is not the man, rather he is more comfortable in enacting the 'Shooting for the Century' model of Cohen.<sup>10</sup>

Concerned by the inadequate outcome of its Afghan Policy, increasing role of China in Afghanistan and the potential of CPEC as a game changer India, instead of pursuing policy of engagement seems comfortable with prolonging its self-defeating policy of destabilising Pakistan. Essentially, to buy time for maintaining status quo and altering demography in Indian Held Kashmir (IHK). The deterioration in Pakistan-India relations and inability of Indian Government to engage in a meaningful dialogue, therefore, emerges as a source of concern. It is mainly due to Indian intransigence, her inability



to recognise changing strategic landscape in South Asia and her policy for seeking regional hegemony rather than cooperation and strategic stability in South Asia.

In the context of Pakistan-Afghan Relations, there has been a substantial change as far as Afghanistan's policy towards Pakistan is concerned. Post US draw down, successful conduct of elections and appointment of President Ashraf Ghani as President of Afghanistan and head of Unity Government augers well for the country as well as Pakistan. The change is laying strong foundation for growth of friendly relations between the two countries. The intra Afghan reconciliation process and the consequent dialogue (although in initial throes and challenged by numerous factors including death of Mullah Umar) remains the strategic way forward. Reconciliation is inevitable while Taliban may strive for a better bargain by continuing with violence. Pakistan's role and China's support in this context remain critical.

Recognising the ongoing changes in global and regional political environment, Pakistan's foreign policy is now more balanced. It needs to be consistently guided by the Quaid's directive of '**Peace Within and Peace Without.**' There has been significant reduction in anti-Americanism in Pakistan and the two states are rebuilding relations recognising and respecting each other's interests. However, it remains for US to balance its international priorities with imperatives of stability in South Asia. Pakistan-China Friendship remains substantive and the CPEC has added depth to it. The balance has also enabled a thaw in Pakistan-Russia relations, this new beginning auger well for both the countries. However, growing instability in Middle East and cleavage caused by Yemen crisis in Pakistan's relations with Arab friends, is a source of concerns. Pakistan's efforts to steer clear of the sectarian conflict in Middle East engineered by Islamic State as well the strategic competition between Iran and Saudi Arabia is essential for pursuing a long term balanced foreign policy for Middle East (reckoning the Iran deal and the rise of IS). Having reviewed the developments in external and internal security matrix to crystallise perspective on challenges and

opportunities, it is pertinent now to analyse the institutional arrangements for formulating and executing national security policy and attendant strategies and measures.

### **National Security Management System (NSMS)**

Pakistan, for decades, has lacked an effective NSMS. The system finds context in the political system of the country. The regular alteration of power between civil and military governments diverted focus and prevented NSMS to mature. The events of 9/11, rapid globalisation, IT revolution and rise of violent non-state actors emphasised the need for evolving comprehensive national security policy and devising a system to formulate, execute and monitor application of the policy. Most developed countries consistent with the threat matrix and genius of its people have developed and deployed NSMS. In Pakistan, NSMS was set up after a long delay by current government. It comprises National Security Committee (NSC) the apex consultative and decision making body for national security policies (the NSC in most western countries is chaired by President/Prime Minister and meets regularly). The NSC and its Academic Committee has been resourced with some national think tanks. The hardware is in place and software is maturing. However the NSMS has not been fully integrated in implementation of NAP. The integration would have enabled it to mature and streamline its processes and procedures making it a more efficient and effective. The NSC is currently engaged in preparing a national security policy yet it, has not assumed the significance which is normally accorded to it in developed countries.

### **National Security Policy Perspective**

Pakistan today, stands at cross roads so far national security is concerned. The positive vibe prevailing in the environment despite enormous challenges combined with bipartisan support for pragmatic policies has the potentials for altering the course of the history. Alternately internal divisions, interest based politics and corruption can prevent that from happening. The international security environment

indicates significant changes. The transition from unipolarity to multipolarity and Pakistan location in the neighbourhood of a global power (China) and emerging regional power (India) which is inimical to former and is aligned with US and West continues to portend challenges and opportunities. The awakening and growing instability in Middle East, rise of Islamic State and intensification in strategic competition astride the Gulf, can inextricably draw Pakistan into a possible fatalistic strategic competition and conflict.

On the domestic front, uncontrolled growth in population, scarcity of power, energy and water resources present enormous governance and security challenges. The economy is rebalancing itself yet demands political action appropriate hard decisions to document undocumented economy, enhance tax base and revenue collection and bring in investments to ignite economic growth. The foremost requirement is to articulate a world view based on the principles laid down by Quaid e Azam of 'Peace within and Peace without.' Political leadership has to provide direction and mobilise census for an inclusive politics, ridding the society of violence and appropriate curricular reforms to rebalance the society and future generations.

### **Political Stability and Quality of Democracy**

Foremost for Pakistan's national security is political stability. It is argued by the analysts that developmental approach to politics may win votes and prolong longevity of formal democracy and the political regimes, yet foundations of a sustainable democracy can only be laid by an elite which respects democracy, democratic institutions and exercises political power through them. For making democracy attractive for a common man, existing formal democracy has to rapidly transition towards a more participatory democracy which incorporates the grass root level. The quality of democracy, governance and state institutions have to improve. The policies should aim at addressing the immediate concerns and problems of the common man. Therefore, political

security and long term stability in Pakistan can be accrued through a participatory democracy which delivers results.

Expectantly pursuant to Supreme Court's decision, election for local governments will be completed in 2015. However, the devolution would only become effective if the respective provincial devolution bills also incorporate transfer of required funds and administrative powers to local governments. Institution of three tiered system of governance will also, in consequence, transform provincial and federal legislatures. Thereon, the members of legislature instead of accruing development funds will have to concentrate on legislating rather than development. The process, it is perceived, would be messy but would require consistency and sustained application. The risk of stagnation can build frustration which can lead to situations not productive for consolidating democracy.

Secondly, the efficacy of state institutions is the foundation on which the structure of national security rests. The state and its political institutions have witnessed some decline over time and have been performing at the sub optimal level. The paradigm has to change. Governance, guided by the principle of minimum government, will have to shed weight in favour of privatisation, become lean, cost effective and more effective. A national commission with the mandate to reform government and governance merits consideration. It should be mandated to make governance less costly and more cost effective. It should review the performance of state institutions, set goals, and decide indicators for performance evaluation and time schedule for periodic review. This will help arrest the decline and turn the course. The commission should comprise experts and consultants reporting directly to the Prime Minister. The devolution of power and application of the principle of minimum government also places premium on effective coordination. Interprovincial Coordination (IPC) Ministry will have to devise procedures and regulatory mechanism to ensure smooth and effective governance.

The Quaid's principle of 'Peace within' should provide the overarching policy guideline. To achieve the internal peace, government with bipartisan support should strengthen participatory democracy, relevant democratic institutions and rule of law. The three tiered system of governance provides requisite forums for dispute resolution and effective administration at relevant levels. In a federated democracy, the role of intra-provincial coordination assumes immense significance. IPC ministry should be capacitated to assume responsibility. Periodic and regular meetings of Council of Common Interest (CCI) can enable dispute resolution and needs to be prompted for fostering a peaceful society.

### **Internal Security**

Thirdly, internal peace and harmony will, in the longer run, provide necessary conditions for revival of economy and respect in the comity of nations. Terrorism, sectarianism and militancy present systemic challenges. The policy of 'Peace Within' can be achieved by relentlessly pursuing the objective of 'zero tolerance of violence in any form' through institutional means to its logical end. It comprises short and long term measures, the short term include Operation Zarb e Azb and removing the criminal elements from cities in particular and society in general. In the long run, the police and judicial system should be able to take on the responsibilities. To this end, they should now build requisite capabilities and capacities. To turn the tide for good, there is a need to review and devise a national curriculum which promotes principles of humanity and tolerance and educates the citizens about their civic responsibilities and national values.

In a globalising and technologically enabled world, it should be expected that the country will be increasingly challenged with new and diverse threats. To proactively and effectively defend against such threats, the internal security apparatus should be modernised. Interior Ministry and its departments/organisations should be able to execute the concept of comprehensive homeland security. They have to be mandated and resourced with deficient agencies, the foremost

need is to bring diverse border management departments under one Authority for Border Security Management (ABSM). The ABSM should be technologically enabled and linked with the military and provincial security mechanisms for deeper reach and effectiveness.

In a federated state, centralised implementation of national internal security policy presents enormous challenges. The mechanism has to expand to incorporate the provinces and to some degree, the local governments in the framework. The provinces play a major role in implementing the policy and making it a success. The provincial departments (Home Secretary, Police and Intelligence departments) should be upgraded to fulfil this responsibility. Attitudinal change in political leaders at provincial levels is, therefore, essential as 'politics as usual' will not accrue desired results; people desire peace and hope for their future generations. Change for better and manifestation of resolve by implementing requisite policies and strategies are essential for creating an orderly and peaceful society.

The second dimension relates to implementation of National Action Plan. The plan comprises three aspects; the military aspect is being catered by Operation Zarb e Azb in FATA and law enforcement agencies in main cities and Balochistan. The ultimate success of Operation Zarb e Zab lies in political and administrative reforms in FATA and PATA areas. There is need to main stream FATA and PATA by absorbing these into KP Province. Instituting reforms for political representation from these areas for national and provincial assemblies and extending uniform local government system.

The second aspect comprises targeting the madaris engaged in violence, criminal and terrorist activities. Having eradicated such elements, the next objective should be to reform madaris in a manner that they do not contribute to extremism and intolerance, rather become harbingers of peace in the society. The third aspect concerning judicial reforms is critical. Setting up of military courts is only an adhoc

arrangement limited in time. The country's judicial system (criminal and anti-terrorist) and laws burden the state rather than the accused. The paradigm has to change, it is the collective responsibility of judiciary and a debt to the nation which they should repay by bringing about paradigmatic change to provide speedy and cheap justice.

The militant forces in Balochistan are devoid of a cause and political support and collude with external powers to destabilise Pakistan. Already, the security situation has manifested a turnaround; an accomplishment which must be consolidated. With the emerging significance of CPEC in the economic turnaround, stability in Balochistan assumes paramount importance. The bonhomie in civil military relations in the province, furnish the much needed environment for crafting and implementing a multipronged strategy incorporating security, governance and economic aspects to the troubled areas. It will extend the writ of state and foster normality. The major aspects of the plan should comprise priority development of the northern route, development in Gwadar Port and city involving local populace and an economic plan for disturbed Baloch areas. Central to long term stability in Gwadar would be the measures to improve the quality of living of local population to include health, education and service sectors. A comprehensive plan for the local fisherman i.e. port facilities and living accommodation needs to be devised incorporating their requirements and aspirations. The Gwadar Development plan should lead to implement the plan to bring about attitudinal change in favour of CPEC. The turnover of governance by end of 2015 should be done in a manner that successes achieved are consolidated. Prime Minister's role in this context will be central.

### **External Security**

The turmoil in Middle East is laden with potential threat which can generate and rapidly multiply sectarian tension and conflict in Pakistan. It is a threat which needs to be handled at policy, strategy and governance levels. The policy of

considered neutrality and engagement with brotherly countries is appropriate and must be relentlessly pursued. Space should not be provided to adversaries to exploit the cleavage. The strategy to insulate borders preventing ingress of Islamic State and not allowing domestic sectarian radicals for participating in the conflict in Syria and Iraq will be critical for the success of the policy. Ministry of Interior should monitor those domestic elements which display proclivity towards sectarian conflicts. It has to be followed up by an extensive media campaign highlighting the moderate nature of our society, inform it about the barbarian face of perpetrators of violence.

Pakistan's foreign policy, guided by the principle of 'Peace Without', should construct strategies and deploy instruments to execute the policy in its neighbourhood and beyond. The foremost challenge persists in context of Afghanistan. Despite the growth of better understanding and joint efforts to combat terrorism in the border areas, the reconciliation still remains the key to success of the policy. The dialogue has suffered a setback due to the death of Mullah Umar. Understandably, the new leadership will take some time to consolidate its authority and power. It is therefore critical that the process of intra Afghan dialogue be carried forward to fruition. Role of Pakistan is critical which it should continue to perform in concert with China sincerely and responsibly.

The third challenge emerges from Indian hegemonic policy aiming to dissuade Pakistan from seeking resolution of Kashmir Issue in accordance with UN Resolutions. Indian policy to coerce Pakistan into a dialogue; a limited agenda set by her is of course, not acceptable. The coercive measures to include intimidation along the Line of Control, destabilising Pakistan by sponsoring terrorism in Pakistan are plainly evident. Indian discomfort with CPEC is equally visible and is feeding into the aforementioned measures. GOP has taken note and voiced concerns, however, efforts in this context have to be strategized to expose true face of India. She had exploited the post 9/11 global sentiments against terrorism and unsuccessfully attempted to obfuscate the Kashmir



struggle, the time has changed and accurate global perspective on Kashmir needs to be re-emphasised with vigour.

At the core of Pakistan's India policy, sits resolution of Kashmir issue in accordance with UN Resolutions. It is imperative, that Pakistan should continue to support people of Kashmir in their just political struggle for their right of self-determination. However, it is also the responsibility of Kashmiris on either side of LOC and Kashmiri Diaspora to lead the struggle. Perhaps time is optimum to seek a Kashmiri Spring.

The pursuit of a balanced foreign policy mandates good relation with existing and emerging poles of power. Suggesting a strategy for this policy is not in the purview of this article. However, the requirement is evident.

### **Economic Security**

The economic measures instituted by GOP are starting to show effects. Recovering from the past downslide, the economy today registers a potential growth of 5.1% in 2015. "Declining inflation, relatively better growth in private sector credit and robust workers' remittance helped propel consumer spending".<sup>11</sup> Narrow tax base, tax evasion and loss making public service enterprises continue to burden the economy and require urgent attention. Policy of stability and recovery should now expand to focus on growth which is essential for job creation. The FDI in form of CPEC if coupled with growth friendly strategies retain the potential to move the country into positive growth and stability phase in short to midterm. Pakistan is a connecting country, with the improvements in communication infrastructure and CPEC, it portends good potentials for increase in trade with Iran and Central Asia, States. Projects like CASA 1000 and Iran Pakistan Gas Pipeline should assist in meeting the energy demand at competitive process. Relentless pursuit of policies facilitating timely completion of these projects is important.

## **Role of Military**

The military is currently performing quintessential constitutional task in restoring internal stability. These measures are strengthening GOP and accruing greater political stability. However, in the long run, it is the responsibility of civil government to create and maintain order and normalcy from the outcome through a political action programme. Expectantly, the operations will be completed by end of 2015, thereby creating conditions for political stabilisation in few years. Support to and strengthening of democracy will help fostering long term political stability in the country.

It is now an opportune time for the military to assist the civil government in articulating a defence policy for future; a policy, which seeks stability through comprehensive deterrence. It should articulate balance between nuclear and conventional deterrence and structured on deploying the former as the first line of defence if the security of the country is threatened. The policy should aim to bring about qualitative change (through indigenous capabilities) in critical components of its conventional deterrence by striking balance between manpower and technology. Similarly, the military strategy is burdened by carry on effects of the past. Guided by policy, there is considerable merit in outthinking similarities with flexible response of cold war era. To draw optimally from the demographic dividend, a balance between all volunteer and professional standing armed forces mixed with a good percentage of volunteer short term service induction carries greater long term strategic advantage.

## **Conclusion**

The article has succinctly reviewed the contemporary security challenges faced by Pakistan, reviewed our policies and institutional capabilities and identified areas of ways to administer change. It has argued for making the NSMS effective, instituting quality participatory democracy for long term political stability and uncovered challenges residing in

the interplay of environment and policies of regional players. In the final analysis, the attitude and approach of the political leaders and their ability to administer effective good governance will be the game changer; a leadership which is focused on serving the people of Pakistan and not on their own political and personal aggrandizement.

## Notes

---

<sup>1</sup>Barry Buzan, *People: States And Fear: National Security Problem In International Relations* (Transasia Publishers, 1987).

<sup>2</sup>Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) and future thrust towards Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) encompassing areas of personal, job, health, education security etc. provide perspective to the notion of Human Security.

<sup>3</sup>In view of the rapid growth in population inability of governance to reach out to people living away from provincial capitals generated a debate for more provinces i.e. creating three provinces in Punjab, two in Kyber Puktoonkawa, Baluchistan and Sindh. There were proposals to convert the divisions into provinces etc. However with the decision of Supreme Court for conducting and institutionalising local governments by September 2015 the debate has been settled for a three tiered governance system. The local governments will incorporate / replace the colonial district management system.

<sup>4</sup>World Bank, *The World Bank Annual Report 2014* (World Bank Publications, 2014).

<sup>5</sup>Samir S. Amir and Syed Danish Hyder, *Pakistan-India-Trade-Normalization-A-Word-of-Caution.pdf* (Karachi: The Pakistan Business Council, 2015), <http://pbc.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2015/07/Pakistan-India-Trade-Normalization-A-Word-of-Caution.pdf>.

<sup>6</sup>"Fatalities in Terrorist Violence in Pakistan 2003-2015," *South Asia Terrorism Portal*, accessed August 25, 2015, <http://www.satp.org/satporgtp/countries/pakistan/database/casualties.htm>. The number of attacks have declined and the balance of the ratio of fatalities in 2015 stood at two terrorist for every civilian/military killed. (759 vs 1552).

<sup>7</sup>Anwer Sumra, "SDPI Report: 58.7m Pakistanis Living below Poverty Line - The Express Tribune," *The Express Tribune*, February 25, 2014.

<sup>8</sup>Mumtaz Alvi and Asim Yasin, "Resolutions in Senate, NA Condemn Statements of Indian Leaders," *The News*, June 12, 2015; Afzal Khan, "India's Role in E. Pakistan Violence to Be Exposed - Khaleej Times," *Khaleej Times*, June 11, 2015, <http://www.khaleejtimes.com/international/india-s-role-in-e.-pakistan-violence-to-be-exposed>. Resolution in Senate, NA condemns statements of Indian leaders, "This House condemns the recent disturbing pattern of provocative and hostile statements from Indian leaders, including threatening strikes.."

<sup>9</sup>\$1.6 billion in real state of Dubai in first quarter of 2014 alone

<sup>10</sup>Stephen P. Cohen, *Shooting for a Century: The India-Pakistan Conundrum* (Washington DC: Brookings Institution Press, 2013).

<sup>11</sup>Amin Ahmed, "Pakistan's Economy to Grow 5.1pc in 2015: ESCAP," *Dawn*, May 15, 2015.

## **INDIA'S LOOK EAST POLICY: CHALLENGES AND OPTIONS FOR PAKISTAN**

*Raja Qaiser Ahmed*

### **Abstract**

*The article focuses on India's emerging trajectory of foreign policy under Narendra Modi's premiership and its moves to evolve closer relations with the eastern economic powers, especially Australia and Japan and its implications for Pakistan. India and Pakistan, the immediate neighbours, are locked into an incessant rivalry since their inception. The change of political rule or a policy schema in either country brings profound implications for the regional competitive environment. This paper seeks to identify the patterns and processes which are likely to be altered in Indian Foreign Policy under Modi and possible responses from Pakistan. The theoretical conception of cognitive interconnectedness of ideas and actions has been used to explain this new trend in the Indian foreign policy.*

### **Introduction**

The India-Pakistan relations are a haunting tale since their inception years more ostensibly in the realm of mutual antagonism and the character of animosity in which they are embedded. The construct of the relations and mutual suspicion which take over the discourse, these bilateral relations can be exhaustively interpreted in the framework of contained instrumentalism<sup>1</sup> which kept the communitarian differentiation intact based on the character of identity.<sup>2</sup>

The interconnectedness in the mutual relations of India and Pakistan has made these polities largely proportional to one another. The eventuality in respect of one brings profound implications for the other. India's threat spectrum and its immediate neighbours are contradictory to one another. India envisages cross border terrorism and external manoeuvring as a major threat<sup>3</sup> as far as the frame of internal security is

concerned. Whereas, on contrary, Pakistan largely identifies internal security threat as the existential one and more fundamentally suspects India's involvement in it.

Pakistan ruling elites' preferences in concordance to India are quite evident

- Pakistan government led by Nawaz Sharif intends to boost economic relations and trade ties with India
- Pakistan aspires to move ahead with the regional integration as the beneficiary of India's rampant economic growth
- Pakistan wants a process of political normalization with India to avoid tragedies like Mumbai and *Samjhota*.

On the contrary, Narendra Modi, the prime minister of India represents a mind-set of Hindu nationalist and a non-accommodative behaviour towards Pakistan at large. His anti-Pakistan sentiments, which he repeatedly reiterated in his election campaigns, speaks volume of the animosity in the relations and dealing towards Pakistan.

Ways are not convenient for Pakistan. An oppositional and ferocious response awaits Pakistan in its bilateral relations with India. India's intransigency and furious reactionism is likely to remain prevalent. The foreign policy relations in South Asia particularly India-Pakistan, largely termed as sub-continental security, is by far the least complex and most accessible. In an anarchic setting with struggle of power and maximization of material capabilities, especially the military kind is of utmost concern. The asymmetry in military capabilities has been leading to a security dilemma, resulting in an outgrowth of military build-ups.

### **India's Electoral Process: Rise of Bharatya Janta Party (BJP) in Power**

It is quite pertinent to narrate that Hindu nationalism of BJP with extreme centrist right ideology, in its first tenure, could not crank out the anticipated outcomes rather proved to be a disaster. A deliberate attempt to alter and modify the

character of national identity through forced Hindutva, religious projectionism, *Babri Masjid* fiasco and amendments in syllabi counterfeited. Since 1991, the Janta culture in India has been on demise. The public acceptance and the Janta narrative were on verge of decline. This two decades' surge is something worth intriguing and raised a question why was Congress defeated and orthodoxy and conventionalism triumphed?

*Nehruvan*<sup>4</sup> model of Indian democracy is fundamentally based on democracy<sup>5</sup> but Indian secularism is based on majoritarianism. The will of majority precedes and dominates. Indian secularism is dual faced when it comes to the case of criminal prosecutions. It has been substantiated with the exoneration of Modi in the case of Gujrat massacre. At centre, secularism operates superficially but at the state level the *Hinduization* takes the lead. How Modi moves ahead with the culmination of Hindu identity and the Indian secularism, will be having far lasting imprints on Indian polity in coming years.

While elucidating the cognitive structure of Indian Elite in the formulation of foreign policy, it appears that ideology no longer plays an important role. India has become rational and pragmatist in pursuing its national goals, the core of them being to preserve the country's pluralistic democracy, protect its territorial unity and integrity, sustain and expand its economic and industrial growth by fully utilizing the opportunities of economic reforms and globalization.<sup>6</sup> The BJP's foreign policy is an amalgamation of ferocious Hindu nationalism and rationalist pursuit of policy choices.

India, a committed status-quo country, aspires to play its role at global level. Indian elite takes into account its unique geographical position, ancient history, natural resources, democracy and culture and is yearning for a conducive and supportive global environment which could pacify India's global aspirations. India longs for a stable neighbourhood, that a prosperous and stable India needs to be at peace with itself and its neighbours need not to be emphasized, for a



troubled neighbourhood not only limits India's global ambitions but also jeopardizes its internal security.

### **BJP's Foreign Policy and Divergences from Congressional Rhetoric**

Bharatya Janta Party (BJP) is perceived as a party on communal basis seeking to eliminate the secular characterization of the Indian polity in which state and society coexist. Political Hinduism and Indian Muslims' Ritualism are often projected as absolute identities contradictory to one another. Multiple identities communitarian caste based and some with regional outlook exist in India and compete to preserve their identities and traditions. The BJP as furious proponent of Hindutva seeks to dominate the value systems and traditions based on majoritarianism.<sup>7</sup>

Political Hinduism<sup>8</sup> is extremely impactful on the contours of national politics in India. An attempt is based on majoritarian culture and to remove the secularism from the equation of liberal democracy with Hindu nationalism having replaced Indian nationalism. The notion and construct of Hindutva and its everlasting imprints on the spectrum of Indian politics can be shrugged aside.<sup>9</sup>

Congressional rhetoric, since the inception of India, has been Liberal democracy + Composite Culture + Indian secularism. *Bharatya Jana Sang* and Janta Culture are counter rhetoric to the Congressional composite culture and their rhetoric is Liberal Democracy + Hindutva + Majoritarianism.<sup>10</sup> BJP is the extension of Janta culture and is primarily obsessed with Hindutva doctrine. Democracy is a defining parameter in India's foreign policy.<sup>11</sup>

When it comes to the foreign policy doctrines of both the mainstream parties, Congress believes in the externalization of the relations with systemic variables more in focus and takes a global manifestation of the foreign policy processes. BJP on the other hand, internalizes the foreign policy variables and believes more in the channelization of domestic

variables. That's why war mongering, war hysteria, and war mania at the home are very likely to happen when a crisis situation occurs in BJP's tenure. The fervent border escalations with the immediate neighbour can also be explained in the given framework.<sup>12</sup>

### **Modi's Redefined Foreign Policy**

India's Look East Policy is not a new policy. It was developed during the tenure of Prime Minister Narsima Rao and successor governments of Vajpayee and Manmohan also pursued this policy.<sup>13</sup> Under this policy, India intends to build cumulative security, economic and strategic ties with Southeast Asian Nations to bolster its status as a regional power. Modi's East mantra is not a new phenomenon but he has re-asserted and redefined it by focusing on Australia and Japan as potential allies.

At the domestic level, Modi is focused on the Delhi-Bombay corridor; and at the regional level, Modi wishes to develop relations with Bangladesh, Myanmar and the Far East. Additionally, the overtone of Modi's eastward push is strategic; it is meant to prove India's relevance in any anti-China collusion with the United States to balance off China in South China Sea and invite American capital investment and sophisticated technology to provide India with a semblance of a power equal to China. In this regard, the Australian apprehensions about the growing Indian naval strength around its seas should also be noted because it will be an opportunity for Pakistan to counterbalance the Indian naval superiority.

### **Modi's East Mantra: From Look East to Act East**

A number of key bilateral and multilateral engagements are the clear manifestations of India's diplomatic push for economic cooperation towards the East. Narendra Modi has moved one step ahead by developing "Act East Policy" in order to illustrate the recent diplomatic expeditions into the South East Asia and Australia.<sup>14</sup>

By shifting the India's Asia policy from "Look East" to "Act East", Prime Minister Narendra Modi indicated that he would be more focused and proactive in the region than his predecessors. From the very beginning of its tenure, he has been actively involved into this region while deliberately excluding Pakistan from its priority list. Not only in the diplomatic sense but also from the economic and strategic point of view, India is intentionally undermining the cooperative postures towards Pakistan.

In a situation where Pakistan has been kept at the back burner, Pakistan has to design a pragmatic roadmap in order to come up with its own version of look East vision. Pakistan has also embarked upon the policy of Look East yet little is heard about how successful it has been for the state.

### **India's Look East Policy: between the Rhetoric and Substance**

India's look East policy can be primarily dubbed as "act East policy". Given India's look East policy Modi is fundamentally targeting Australia and Japan where trade, investment, maritime cooperation, security ties and creating linkages at societal level are his focus areas. PM Modi visited Australia after the hiatus of 28 years when PM Rajiv Gandhi went there in 1986. He became the first Indian PM who addressed the Australian parliament.<sup>15</sup>

India, Australia and Japan had their high level trilateral moot in June 2015. Indian foreign secretary represented India in these talks whereas vice foreign minister of Japan and secretary of the Department of Foreign Affairs Australia attended the meeting. The trilateral moot discussed a wide range of issues with maritime security as the top agenda. Cooperation vis-a-vis free navigation in the South China Sea, Indian Ocean and Pacific Ocean was also discussed. The greater prospects for economic cooperation were deliberated upon. A joint three nations' naval exercise is also on the cards.<sup>16</sup>

## **India-Australia Relations**

Australia and India are sharing history of positive Defence relationship after 2006 when India and Australia signed MOU on Defence cooperation and in 2009, signed a joint declaration on security cooperation. The Defence relationship between Australia and India has grown and includes new forums for strategic dialogue, and a frequent interaction through visits of senior officials. Training exchange programmes and staff talks are also boosting the bilateral relations.

In his visit to Australia while making speech to the parliament of Australia, Modi touched on all important aspects of bilateral relations between India and Australia with the spin of regional and global political and strategic setting. He stated that Australia was not in the periphery of their vision; it was in the center of their thought. With Australia, Modi signed five agreements on social security, arts and culture, combating narcotics trade, tourism and transfer of sentenced prisoners.<sup>17</sup>

The current trade between India and Australia stands at 15 billion dollars which is much below the potential agreed by both the leaders. In 2012, in a meeting between the then Indian PM Manmohan Singh and Australian PM Julia Gillard, it was committed to enhance bilateral trade to 100 billion dollars by 2015. Both the countries are working to finalise a free trade deal by the end of next year. The aspiration and decision was also prompted by a comprehensive trade deal signed between Modi and Jinping during the visit whereby 95 percent of Australian exports would go to Chinese market with zero tariff.

## **Modi's Make in India**

Modi's mantra "Make in India" can be complemented with "Spend in India." From building toilets to smart cities, he invites investment from the potential investors. Demand, development and demographics are the key drivers for

investing in India. 800 million people are below the age of 35 which presents a rosy scenario for cheap and skilled labour-an attractive message to the investors. Though power development index is still a major problem and poverty still haunts India to the large extent.

Modi said that opportunities existed for Australians in different sectors including energy, agriculture, infrastructure, food, finance, manufacturing processing, technology and mining. He urged providing finances, resources, technology and expertise to working partners and investors. Modi claimed that overall trade ties between the two countries would be grounded in familiar democratic framework.

### **Security and Strategic Aspects**

India and Australia earlier concluded a strategic pact in 2009 but considering the lukewarm follow up this time, they decided to upgrade the strategic ties.<sup>18</sup> A Framework for Security Cooperation was signed between the two leaders. Action plan to lend weight to the framework has also been established. As per the plan:

- Annual summit and foreign policy exchanges and coordination
- Defence policy planning and coordination
- Counter-terrorism and other transnational crimes
- Border protection, coast guard, and customs
- Disarmament, non-proliferation, civil nuclear energy and maritime security
- Disaster management and peacekeeping
- Cooperation in regional and multilateral fora<sup>19</sup>

Counter-terrorism figured prominently in Modi's engagement with the Australian leadership. He underlined the need and importance to work at regional and global level to form a strategy to counter the global threat of violence.

## **Maritime Cooperation**

Modi intends to build close naval partnership with Australia. Knowing the reach and significance of Australia in terms of its maritime potential, he is seeking cooperation in this regard. “The oceans are our lifelines. But, we worry about its access and security in our part of the world more than ever before,”<sup>20</sup>

The security dimension is again at the core of maritime cooperation with an aim to counter piracy, securing sea-lanes and harnessing the economic potential of the marine resources. Maritime security has also been included in the framework for security cooperation, marking its importance to advance the bilateral ties as well as regional security complex.

## **Civil Nuclear Deal**

India wants Australia to expedite the civil nuclear deal so that uranium can be imported by India. Building a case for uranium import from Australia after the agreement, Modi confidently stated that the deal would give Australia an opportunity to be the part of one of the safest and secure nuclear energy programme.<sup>21</sup> The assertion was aimed at Abbott who earlier minced no words that the nuclear deal would be finalized if all goes well and with suitable safeguards in place. Australians want to ensure what any deal with India would be in line with their commitment for cleaner energy.

Nuclear commerce and trade is an important issue in Indian foreign policy ever since the Civil Nuclear Pact was concluded with the US in 2008. India was treated as nuclear pariah due to its status as non-NPT member having incurred restrictions by the Nuclear Suppliers Group (NSG). India could not engage by any means in nuclear trade; be it a military or civilian purpose. However, India got NSG waiver along with an additional IAEA protocol and the amendment of the US domestic laws relating to regulation of nuclear commerce. India started being treated as an exception to the rules and regimes of global non-proliferation and all that was

made possible to facilitate the Indo-US nuclear deal (2008) which otherwise was not in coming.<sup>22</sup>

Following the Indo-US nuclear deal, India became eligible to engage in nuclear commerce not only with the US, but all other countries possessing nuclear technology and signatories of NPT at the same time. Following this breakthrough, India has signed nuclear deals with Russia, Kazakhstan, France, UK, Argentina, Namibia, South Korea, Canada and Mongolia. The Indo-US nuclear deal which in fact is the deal between India and NSG members, allowed India to expand its nuclear complex for civilian purposes whereas sparing its military facilities from IAEA scrutiny.<sup>23</sup>

Australia is interested in selling civilian nuclear technology to India. Even the US gave a rationale while concluding the agreement with India that it would benefit the former economically creating 27 thousand jobs annually and bringing 1 billion dollars to the national kitty. India is aware of untapped potential to expand nuclear commercial links with countries which are willing to trade with it. In this connection, PM Modi made it a point during his visit to Japan to accelerate the stalled talks on the issue. The visit of Australian Prime Minister Tony Abbot to India in September 2014 brought dividends to India as both have agreed to cement the ties with nuclear trade topping the agenda.

India and Australia started negotiating on uranium sales in 2012 right after Australia lifted a long-time ban on exporting the uranium ore to Delhi to meet its ambitious and high capability nuclear energy programme.<sup>24</sup> Australia, the third largest uranium producer, had previously declined such exports to India amid India's non signatory status of the non-proliferation treaty. This is where the nuclear deal with the US came handy for India paving the path for vetting the appetite to augment its civilian nuclear programme. Australia aims to sell 10 thousand tons of yellow cake/uranium by 2017. The ambition fits well with the Indian efforts to import nuclear energy for civilian purposes what they term as peaceful and for power generation.

India argues that, as a fast-rising economy, it needs nuclear energy to keep pace with its emerging profile. According to the World Bank, 400 million people in India are without electricity. India insists to accumulate nuclear energy to meet its electricity demands with a view to lighting-up villages in its nooks and crannies. India hence, successfully puts a humanitarian spin on its desire to optimize its civilian nuclear capability. The agreement will allow India to add 20 small plants in operation at present. Moreover, it will lessen India's reliance on coal and make a shift to more environment-friendly nuclear energy for power generation.

### **India-Japan Relations: From Economics to Nuclear Cooperation**

Given the priority of nations, civil nuclear cooperation is an important aspect of Japan-India bilateral relations and is expected to be on the top of agenda list for the prosperity of two nations as defined by their policy makers. Both the nations intend to continue the use of civil nuclear power, having recognized its risks. Japan's nuclear policy had been a hurdle while negotiating with India, Turkey, South Africa and other nations on civil nuclear agreements; so most of the deliberations went inconclusive.<sup>25</sup>

With the rollover of new century, the peaceful persuasion of nuclear power got recognized as one of the workable and effective measures to combat global warming and to surge economic growth. The Great East Japan Earthquake in May 2011 and the unfortunate occurrence of Fukushima Daiichi nuclear power plant triggered new rounds of discussion and deliberation on the risks and threats of civil nuclear power, not primarily in Japan but also in many countries.<sup>26</sup>

As indicated by the media reports, arrangements are being continued and basic assentation was arrived at with Turkey in March 2012. India-Japan mutual ties have extended in areas of vital concerns including security and economic ties. India-Japan collaboration in the trading of nuclear technology has high potential for development. India is searching for different



avenues to measure up the expanding demand to support its economic development. Japan has developed into a country with high nuclear sophistication and the conjunction of these two variables is taking the India-Japan relationship forward. Both the nations have focused on the requirement for controlling the proliferation of Weapons of Mass Destruction (WMDs).

In December 2001, in a joint statement, heads of both the governments had consented to work as partners against non-proliferation and to take some serious measures in the export of dual used, sensitive and cautious technology. The nuclear issue has two angles, to be specific, the interest for abandoning nuclear weapons and crafting a mechanism for the peaceful use of nuclear technology.<sup>27</sup>

Japan is very precise to the issues of nuclear proliferation and public opinion is concerned about the issues of nuclear proliferation of any form. Despite the fact that Japan is now at understandable level of India's position and history of use of nuclear energy for non-military and civilian purposes. India-Japan ties went under severe turmoil after India's 1998 atomic tests at Pokhran. Japan deferred all its monetary help to the then on-going ventures. The move was perceived in India as Japan's hyper response and absence of comprehension of India's impulses. Political relations consistently enhanced from 2001 onwards. In the field of conceivable participation in the areas of common interest between India and Japan, divergences do exist.

Amid his visit to India in December 2009, Hatoyama had insinuated the likelihood of Japan beginning to export nuclear supplies and other high tech technology in his discussion with Prime Minister Manmohan Singh. The Japanese government and in addition the general population appears befuddled on what stance Japan ought to bring with respect to nuclear cooperation with India. While there is no sharp rift in the Liberal Democratic Party (LDP) or the decision Democratic Party of Japan (DPJ) that would debilitate a part in either party on the issue, the DPJ ends up amidst characterizing a

course that would not forsake Japan's expressed strategy on nuclear disarmament. Meantime, encouraging nuclear exports with India. In spite of the fact that still wary, Japan recognizes India's strategic significance. There is more appreciation in Japan that peaceful use of nuclear technology would help India battle with global warming.

The two nations had their first round of discussions on 28 June 2010 went for fixing a respective civilian nuclear cooperation agreement. Under this agreement, Japan would export nuclear innovation and related gear to India while barring India from utilizing them for military and strategic purposes or proliferation them to any other nation. In particular, Japan needs to cooperate with India, for the reasons mentioned below:

- The political orientation of this cooperation
- The India's drive to deal with energy scarcity
- The increasing threat of global warming;
- The promotion and enhancement of cooperation in science and technology
- The contribution of Japanese exporters involved in nuclear power.<sup>28</sup>

Japan is one of the few well equipped advanced producers of nuclear power reactors. If Japan relaxes its policy and consents to cooperate with India, the nuclear market itself will unleash growth potential in a decade around \$100–150 billion.<sup>29</sup> This is a huge attraction for Japan to reconsider its position soon.

Consortium of 13 Japanese companies joined hands on 22 October 2010 to establish International Nuclear Energy Development of Japan Co. Ltd. (JINED), headquartered in Tokyo, to commence and engage in activities that may lead to the proposals supporting nuclear power projects in the emerging countries.<sup>30</sup>

Pakistan and Japan share a history of long relations. Japan is the second major donor to Pakistan after United States.

Realising this fact, India under Modi's government, is trying to craft a sustainable roadmap of relations with Japan. This is a fact that no visible change in the bilateral ties has occurred yet. The nuclear agreement is yet to be reached, and the cooperation on the US-2 is only a dream for the distant future. In Japan nowadays, not much attention is paid on the negotiations between the two countries. The Japanese business circle might have expected a "miracle" at the initial stage of Modi government, but no substantial development has occurred.

### **Modi's Policy: Myth and Reality**

Since Modi got elected as the Prime Minister, there had been much hue and cry across the globe. Modi was presented as a messiah. His personal attributes and his charisma were the most debated topics in national and international press. The reality after one and a half year in the government presents a very different picture.

Modi's policy revolves around more rhetoric than substance. He is aggressively pursuing the options but nothing substantive has been achieved or reached out yet. Admittedly, Asia's new geopolitics revolves around India, Japan and Australia but Modi, though is pushing for the strategic framework in the indo-pacific with considerable currency, but the only success in this regard is the trilateral dialogue.

Modi at home, is facing some serious challenges in meeting the promises, he made during his election campaign. There had been a drastic decline in his popularity at home. Corruption still remains India's biggest predicament. BJP lost elections in Kashmir and was defeated at the hands of Aam Admi Party in the state elections of Delhi. Modi phenomenon in India is slightly fizzling out.

## **Pakistan in the Matrix: Lessons and Recommendations**

The policy by Narendra Modi towards the East marked by a number of key bilateral and multilateral engagements is the manifestation of diplomatic push towards the unexplored continent. The strategic and security considerations are also weighed in to the desired extent. Engagement with NRIs and the domestic audience of the host countries are also on the front burner. The cosmetics of the diplomatic niceties however, should not cause the onlookers to overplay the downside of the broad engagement by Modi.

Pakistan has to confront and respond to the challenges posed by Indian designs and manoeuvres. The policy dispensation of BJP would have a direct implications for Pakistan. Keeping a checkmate on India's moves is vital. Strategic countering is necessary but economic restructuring of the country is direly needed. Modi is inviting foreign companies and corporations to invest in the sectors of energy and human development. Pakistan should also conceive and chalk out a comprehensive plan to rehab economy, foreign investment and regional trade.

### **China Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC): A Possible Antidote**

It is important to note that trade is always linked with security. It can reduce antagonism and aggravate rivalry at the same time. CPEC can prove to be both. However, India's look East policy clearly depicts that India will not only have access to capital investments and technology from the developed world but also acquire a strategic backyard to assert its hegemony in South Asia. CPEC will increase China's stakes in the region. The economy-led security apparatus will lure China into saving its interests in Pakistan, thus reducing the power imbalance created by Modi's Look East policy.

Pakistan can facilitate and contribute to the regional trade. Pakistan's relations with the Islamic world can prove pivotal

in revitalizing the importance of its strategic location. It can also become the central point in any kind of future free-trade agreement among the Muslim countries. Pakistan-China Economic Corridor provides Pakistan with an opportunity to assert the importance of its strategic location, especially vis-a-vis Persian Gulf.

In addition to providing China with a short route, Pakistan can also facilitate other countries for transit trade with Central Asia. Pakistan's growing relations with SCO countries will benefit the member states to use Gwadar for their trade. Once the member states start trading through Pakistan, strategic importance of the latter is likely to increase.

Economic Corridor is not only aiming at building massive road infrastructure but also wants to develop telecommunications and energy infrastructure. A comprehensive analysis needs to be made of the economic prospects regarding this economic route. This massive investment plan of China in Pakistan will make Pakistan a regional economic hub and would further boost the bilateral ties between China and Pakistan. CPEC can be termed as game changer and the fate changer in the region. Chinese are not just only offering Pakistan a massive infrastructure but are making Pakistan a key partner in this grand economic ambitions that relate to the proposed 21<sup>st</sup> century Silk Route initiative. The corridor would enable China's access to the Indian Ocean lead to the massive investments, and help easing out power shortages that are obstructing economic growth of Pakistan. Corridor will connect significant economic agents along predefined geography. It will connect economic hubs and certain landscapes where substantial economic resources and actors are concentrated.

## **Conclusion**

If the Indian moves succeed, it will be the first time after independence that India would become geo-strategically relevant to the international politics. In that case, India will not only have access to direct capital investments and

technology from the developed world, but also acquire a strategic backyard to assert its hegemony in a more aggressive manner in South Asia.

Pakistan has to craft a realistic roadmap to follow its own version of “Look East vision.” In reaction to Indian moves, countries located in East can be engaged. Pakistan needs to counter India by emphasizing its own strategic position especially in the Indian Ocean, its Islamic linkages and the economic opportunities that could result by contacts with Central Asia, South West Asia and beyond. Instead of being reactive in approach, Pakistan should be proactive in policies. A foreign policy white paper in the wake of current regional dynamics focusing on look East vision can be the first step in this direction. The white paper can identify key interest areas, viable measures to secure these interests and find Pakistan’s relevance in the political, commercial and strategic configuration of the region. Matching India move to move is definitely not viable, but Pakistan can make its presence felt in countries where India is making big inroads.

China Pakistan Economic Corridor is a game changer. It will connect Pakistan with the emerging Central Asian economies, Pakistan, an inroad to the new silk route, will increase the significance of Pakistan as a key regional player. Pakistan can make a multilateral foreign policy that could reassert its position. Pakistan can further improve its relations with Russia, though in this regard, both the countries recently have signed a landmark defence deal for the purchase of MI-35 helicopters. Optimization of pragmatic foreign policy choices and decisions in the wake of changing regional scenario is much needed to counter the proactive Modi mantra.

## **Notes**

---

<sup>1</sup>Contained instrumentalism is a theory that explains the manipulation of identity variable and its instrumental usage to solidify the identity differences.

<sup>2</sup> Muhammad Mujeeb Afzal, *Bharatya Janta Party and Indian Muslims* (Karachi: Oxford University Press, 2014), 25.

<sup>3</sup>Jaswant Sing, *India at Risk: Mistakes, Misconceptions and Misadventures of Security Policy* (New Delhi: Rupa Publications, 2013), 13.

<sup>4</sup>Nehruvan State is a phrase used by the researchers and academics to describe the early years of Indian polity when Nehru was Indian Prime Minister from 1947-64.

<sup>5</sup>Mujeeb Afzal, *Ibid*

<sup>6</sup>Mujeeb Afzal, *Ibid*

<sup>7</sup>*Ibid*, Mujeeb Afzal, 225.

<sup>8</sup>Political Hinduism is a philosophy that believes in the manifestation and accentuation of Hindutva doctrine and believes that the superiority of Hinduism lies in the vedic era.

<sup>9</sup> Parvathy Appiah. *Hindutva, Ideology and Politics* (New Delhi: Deep & Depp publications Ltd. 2003) 36

<sup>10</sup>Majoritarianism is usually associated with the Hindutva philosophy of Hindu nationalists that presumes the definition of Indian political processes to be based on the definition of majority i.e Hindus.

<sup>11</sup> S.D. Muni, *India's Foreign Policy The Democracy Dimension*, Cambridge University Press Limited India, 2009.

<sup>12</sup>See Also AparnaPande, *Explaining Pakistan's Foreign Policy: Escaping India* (Routledge: Contemporary South Asia Series, 2011)

<sup>13</sup>ThongkholalHaokip, "India's Look East Policy: Its Evolution and Approach," *South Asian Survey*, Vol. 18, No. 2 September (2011): 239-257

<sup>14</sup>PrashanthParameswaran, "Modi Unveils India's 'Act East Policy' to ASEAN in Myanmar," *The Diplomat*, November 17, 2014,

[www.thediplomat.com/2014/11/modi-unveils-indias-act-east-policy-to-asean-in-myanmar/](http://www.thediplomat.com/2014/11/modi-unveils-indias-act-east-policy-to-asean-in-myanmar/).

---

<sup>15</sup>PM Narendra Modi's address to the Australian Parliament, *The Indian Express*, November 18, 2014.

<http://indianexpress.com/article/india/india-others/full-text-prime-minister-narendra-modis-address-to-the-australian-parliament/>

<sup>16</sup>Prashanth Parameswaran, India, Australia, Japan Hold First Ever Trilateral Dialogue, *The Diplomat*, June 09, 2015.

<http://thediplomat.com/2015/06/india-australia-japan-hold-first-ever-trilateral-dialogue/>

<sup>17</sup>India, Australia agree on new security cooperation framework, *India Tribune*, November 18, 2014  
[http://www.indiatribune.com/index.php?option=com\\_content&view=article&id=13184:india-australia-agree-on-new-security-cooperation-framework&catid=118:politics](http://www.indiatribune.com/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=13184:india-australia-agree-on-new-security-cooperation-framework&catid=118:politics)

<sup>18</sup> Rajiv Nayam, 'Strategic Significance of the India-Australia Civil Nuclear Cooperation Agreement', *Institute for Defence Studies and Analyses*, September 15, 2014.

[http://www.idsa.in/idsacomments/StrategicSignificanceoftheIndiaAustralia\\_rnayam\\_150914.html](http://www.idsa.in/idsacomments/StrategicSignificanceoftheIndiaAustralia_rnayam_150914.html)

<sup>19</sup>Framework for Security Cooperation between India and Australia, *Press Information Bureau*, Government of India, Prime Minister's Office.

<http://pib.nic.in/newsite/PrintRelease.aspx?relid=111501>

<sup>20</sup>Modi's Speech at Australian Parliament, *Express News Services*, November 18, 2014.

<http://indianexpress.com/article/india/india-others/full-text-prime-minister-narendra-modis-address-to-the-australian-parliament/>

<sup>21</sup>Modi's Speech, Ibid

<sup>22</sup> W.P.S. Sidhu, 'Re-energizing India-U.S. Civil Nuclear Cooperation', *Brookings India*, August 27, 2014.

<http://www.brookings.edu/research/opinions/2014/09/23-reenergizing-india-us-civil-nuclear-cooperation-sidhu>

<sup>23</sup>Smirti Chand, 'Agreements on Nuclear Energy that India has Signed with Different Countries'

<http://www.yourarticlelibrary.com/nuclear/agreements-on-nuclear-energy-that-india-has-signed-with-different-countries/5762/>

<sup>24</sup>Anthony Fansom, 'Atomic Allies? India and Australia Explore Uranium Sales', *The Diplomat*, November 1, 2012.



<http://thediplomat.com/2012/11/atomic-allies-india-and-australia-explore-uranium-sales/>

<sup>25</sup>Emma Channlet Avery & Mary Beth Nikitin, "Japan's Nuclear Future: Policy Debate, Prospects and U.S. Interests", *CRS Report for Congress*, Congressional Research Service, February 19, 2009.

<sup>26</sup>Takako Hirose and Takeshi Yokoo, 'Japan-India Nuclear Cooperation', *Defence & Security Alert*,

<http://www.dsalert.org/int-experts-opinion/international-geopolitics/595-japan-india-nuclear-cooperation>

<sup>27</sup>Rajaram Panda & Ch. ViyyannaSastry, "India and Japan: Prospects for Civil Nuclear Cooperation", *Indian Foreign Affairs Journal* Vol. 6, No. 2, April–June (2011): 202-216

<sup>28</sup>Rajaram Panda & Ch. ViyyannaSastry, *Ibid*

<sup>29</sup>Rajaram Panda & Ch. ViyyannaSastry, *Ibid*

<sup>30</sup>Rajaram Panda, "India-US Insight", *Indian Council for Research on International Economic Relations*, (2012): Vol 2, Issue 7, 2.

## COUNTERING EXTREMISTS' NARRATIVE IN PAKISTAN

*Fatima Sajjad*

### **Abstract**

*This paper examines the current confrontation between Pakistani state and militant Islamist groups through the lens of social constructivism. Based on the core constructivist belief that 'ideas matter', this paper critically examines some popular narratives in Pakistan which support the militants' worldview. It attempts to identify the factors which inspire Pakistani public to sanction the extremists' narratives. This paper also explores the alternative ideas within the shared paradigm of religion in Pakistan, which, if promoted through education, may reduce the growing religious radicalism in the country.*

**Key Words:** ideology, narratives, extremism, Islamism, peace building.

*"Since wars begin in the minds of men, it is in the minds of men that the defences of peace must be constructed." - UNESCO Constitution 1945.*

Ideas and ideologies have played a key role in shaping the identity of Pakistan as a nation. The internal war Pakistan faces today has been described as an existential threat to the country as it hits the core of the ideological construction of Pakistan. A military operation like *Zarb-i-Azb*<sup>1</sup> is unlikely to counter religious extremism in Pakistan which remains the root cause of the current ideological conflict retaining a wide popular appeal.<sup>2</sup> The importance of belonging to religious rather than secular ideals for Pakistan is evident by the name given to the military operation against the self proclaimed Islamist militants.<sup>3</sup> Religion remains a potent force in Pakistan. This paper makes a case for devising a counter extremist narrative in Pakistan.

The phenomenon of religious radicalism in Pakistan has been a subject of intense academic discussion in recent years.<sup>4</sup> Among the various factors identified as the causes of growing radicalism in the country, connection between popular notions defining the national identity and militants' stated aspirations have been pointed out.<sup>5</sup> One of the key strengths of the militants is their ability to manipulate the religion-based popular narratives to their advantage. An effective counterterrorism strategy must aim to counter this strength of the militants and challenge them in the realm of ideas. This paper examines the ideological dimension of the conflict between the religious militants and the state of Pakistan. Using the social constructivist lens, this study explores answers to the following questions: a) Why do the people of Pakistan endorse the narratives of extremism propagated by the Islamist militants; b) What alternatives may be constructed to counter the narratives of extremism in Pakistan? It argues that a major factor that enables extremists to use religion to their advantage is the state's inability to promote the intellectual, liberal and compassionate aspects of Islam. Due to a variety of political and historical factors,<sup>6</sup> popular discourse<sup>7</sup> and public education<sup>8</sup> in Pakistan largely ignores these dominant themes of religion which if promoted through education, may serve as a key to resolve the problem of extremism in Pakistan. This paper argues that since religion provides the power to the extremists' narratives, it is only through religion that they can be effectively countered.

The proposed argument is embedded in social constructivist approach in international relations theory which deems that humans' behaviour is determined by their identity which itself is shaped by society's values, norms, history, practices and institutions.<sup>9</sup>

The term 'narratives of extremism' in this study, refers to the shared ideas and stories which form the public opinion in Pakistan and promote a particular worldview which tends to be confrontational. 'Countering' the narratives of extremism refers to exploring ways to effectively counter the popular

confrontational notions and replacing them with ideas that promote peaceful coexistence.

### **Pakistan and the Rising Religious Radicalism**

A number of recent studies express concern about the growing religious radicalism in Pakistan. Dr. Hasan Askari Rizvi, a noted Pakistani political analyst, ranks militancy and extremism as the top most challenge faced by Pakistan today.<sup>10</sup> According to him, the growing religious orthodoxy has caused 'irreparable damage to Pakistan's social fabric'.<sup>11</sup> The youth is especially vulnerable to the growing radical ideology which is weakening the bond between state and people, as loyalty to a transnational Muslim community replaces the notions of citizenship and civic obligations. The emphasis of radical Islamist discourse for total transformation of society has given rise to a culture of defiance leading to societal anarchy.

Moeed Yusuf, another key political commentator in Pakistan, presents a study showing with empirical data that religious and national identities remain inherently linked in Pakistan.<sup>12</sup> The statistics show that the majority of youth wants to see Pakistan as an Islamic state, and strongly relate themselves with their respective religious sect. They are vulnerable to conspiracy theories and popular discourse based on emotions rather than logic. Fair and Shapiro present the result of polling data obtained in 2009 showing that nearly 70 percent Pakistanis want *sharia* to play a larger role in Pakistan's law and most believing that *sharia* means good governance.<sup>13</sup>

Haider terms this phenomenon as 'Talibanization' of Pakistan which in his view is 'an existential militant Islamist threat' to the country.<sup>14</sup> Haider advocates not only a military but an ideological response to this threat by taking Islamic parties on board and promoting the traditional Sufi Islam which has historically remained popular amongst the masses with its inclusive and flexible teachings.

Although, rising extremism has become clearly visible in recent years, many authors trace its roots to the troubled decade of 1980s. Two important books on this subject refer to the Mecca uprising in 1979 as the starting point of a new wave of Islamist radicalism in the Muslim world.<sup>15</sup>

Shahzad<sup>16</sup> and Husain<sup>17</sup> point out that the idea of rejecting Muslim ruling elite as Western agents and transforming Muslim society by force, began to take root after the Mecca incident in 1979. Husain explains the impact of the shockwaves created by this incident across the Muslim world. Shahzad describes in detail the ideological roots of the radical movement in the work of medieval ideologue Ibn Tamiyyah. Both authors agree that the 1979 incident was the beginning of the culture of defiance in the Muslim world.

Ahmad takes a deeper view of the ideological conflict in the country pointing out the ambiguities inherent in Pakistan's constitution and construction of national ideology.<sup>18</sup> He describes how the insistence on a 'fixed ideology' has brushed aside the voices of dissent. Even powerful voices like that of Javed Iqbal<sup>19</sup> to modernize traditional sharia have been completely ignored in the past, allowing a dogmatic ideology to take root in the popular mindset. Disregard of the intellectual tradition in Islam in favor of a fixed ideology created conflicts which were later exploited by the militant extremists.

Basit and Rathore offer an empirical study showing various trends and patterns of radicalization in Pakistan.<sup>20</sup> This study presents a mix picture showing public opinion as divided on the question of favoring Taliban. However, on the question of struggle for implementation of *sharia*, majority consider it a *jihad* thus accepting unwillingly and perhaps unknowingly the justification of violence by the militant Islamist groups.

Siddiqi studies the trends among urban and educated youth of Pakistan concluding that educated Pakistani youth has embraced radicalism not because they really understand the underlying ideology but because the popular discourse

promotes such a worldview and alternative discourse is not visible.<sup>21</sup> The popular stereotypes of 'us vs. them' have been adopted by young minds without much conscious thought. Sial and Anjum conclude that Pakistanis remain confuse over the issues of extremism, jihad and radicalization due to their inherent religiosity which in the absence of education and critical thinking creates uncertainty and confusion.<sup>22</sup>

Waseem describes how the public life in Pakistan since 1950s has been increasingly shaped by an alternative religious discourse.<sup>23</sup> Religious parties especially Jamat-i-Islami used education to promote its ideas and influence. Waseem outlines three stages of 'Talibanization' of the country. From the state support to Taliban regime in Afghanistan in 1990s to post 9/11 operations in Federally Administered Tribal Area (FATA) and finally the intensification of conflict between state and militant Islamist groups after the Jamia Hafsa incident. According to Waseem, Pakistan Army has been unable to control internal militancy because it has been cultivating and mobilizing some of these forces itself and wants to keep these elements alive against India. Militant discourse, therefore, has not been controlled and remains freely accessible to the general public.

Khan points out how the Islamist organizations in Pakistan have effectively built on prevalent narratives in Pakistan to promote their worldview.<sup>24</sup> The counter terrorism strategy in Pakistan does not take into account the powerful impact of these narratives and ways to counter them. According to Khan, the 'right' message must be crafted and promoted, to effectively counter the militant discourse.

### **Why do Pakistanis Approve the Militant Islamist Narratives?**

As the academics express concern about the widespread support for militant Islamist narratives in Pakistan, examining the factors which constructed this phenomenon becomes imperative. Some key structural factors that gradually built the social consensus towards religious radicalism in Pakistan,

are briefly examined below with reference to the popular narratives they support.

### **Historical Overview**

The 9/11 episode was the culmination of a clash which began centuries ago with the advent of Western modernity in the Muslim lands. Muslims in many parts of the world experienced the invasion of Western modernity as 'aggressive, invasive and exploitative'.<sup>25</sup> During the early modern era the relative decline of the Islamic world and the challenge of European colonial rule instigated various debates in the Muslim world. Muslims sought explanation of their decline which gave rise to three different perspectives in the Muslim world.

- The Conservative activists; like Rashid Rida, Hasan al Banna emphasized the revitalization of religion and political change. In South Asia the *ulama* of *Deoband* and the *Ahl-i-Hadith* typically belonged to this group.
- The Secularists; who argued that it is the 'continuing influence of the backward tradition in Muslim society' which is the cause of its decline. Mustafa Kemal Ataturk was a representative of this school.
- The reformists who advocated reform of the medieval scholasticism which has slowed down the growth of Muslim thought.

They sought innovation and dynamism in Islamic thought which is demanded by the modern age. Jamal ud Din Afghani and Muhammad Abduh belonged to this group.<sup>26</sup> In South Asia, Allama Shibli Nomani (1857-1914) a well-known Indian Muslim scholar from early 20<sup>th</sup> century, whose scholarly work and contribution to *Nadwatul Ulama*, a university dedicated to Islamic reform, left a profound impact on modern Islamic thought in India,<sup>27</sup> and Muhammad Iqbal, the inspirational poet, philosopher and a leading intellectual of the 20<sup>th</sup> century, belonged to this school of thought.<sup>28</sup>

These three strands of thinking continued in the Muslim world. Pakistan, since inception, inherited these debates which were prevailing in other parts of the Muslim world as well during the twentieth century. The tensions between liberal, conservative, Islamist and reformist elements have dominated the discourse on ideology and identity of Pakistani nation up to this day.<sup>29</sup>

The struggle for Pakistan began when India's Muslim minority sought protection against the Hindu majority domination. The 'Islam in danger' narrative is thus embedded in the public mindset strengthened by the shared experiences of a religiously charged freedom movement, colonial subjugation, Hindu egoism, and a violent partition. Religiously motivated political activism was inherited by the country since its inception in 1947.

### **The Cold War Milieu**

The cold war atmosphere charged with ideological debates, in the later part of the twentieth century intensified the ideological arguments within the Islamic world. Pakistan with its stated claim to be an 'ideological state' remained at the centre of such debates.<sup>30</sup> Arguments for the Islamic 'ideology' against Communist, Capitalist ideologies began to shape the public discourse<sup>31</sup>. The urban educated Pakistanis being religiously conservative and emotionally attached to their faith readily engaged with this discourse which gradually became a part of their collective psyche.<sup>32</sup> The idea of Islam as religion and tradition gradually gave way to the idea of Islam as an ideology.<sup>33</sup> Ideologies in twentieth century context were essentially radical, confrontational and political. Hence, religious radicalism evolved in Pakistan, accompanied by a host of other factors which steered public perceptions towards this direction.

A central feature of global politics during cold war was the Islamist-capitalist nexus; the Islamist movements of the 20<sup>th</sup> century joined hands with Western capitalist bloc especially during the last decade of the cold war to wage jihad against



communism. The growth of Islamist militancy is the legacy of this era.

Pakistan's direct involvement in America's cold war politics and battles, as the 'most allied ally'<sup>34</sup> in 1950s and 'the frontline state'<sup>35</sup> in 1980s and later after 9/11, provided sufficient credibility to the following narratives described by Khan as Al-Qaeda's master narratives, which were sold like hot cakes in Pakistan.

*"There is a war going on against Islam, and the West is a major enemy. Muslim rulers are agents of the West".<sup>36</sup>*

### **The Geography**

The perception of being under a constant threat was strengthened in Pakistan by geostrategic concerns as well.<sup>37</sup> Surrounded by archrival India in the East, an unstable and often hostile Afghanistan in the West, the enduring Kashmir conflict in the North, which led to at least three full scale wars with India, Pakistan remained preoccupied with security concerns since its inception.<sup>38</sup>

It is again due to its geostrategic location that Pakistan remained at the centre of world politics during the cold war and later during post 9/11 war on terror. On a number of occasions, geostrategic compulsions got the country entangled into unintended wars. Pakistan remained on the frontline during the wars in Afghanistan in 1980s and 2000s. Owing to its geographical location the country rarely had a choice to stay away from these international battles which left a deep mark on its political and social landscape.

### **The US Factor**

The shared perception of the 'US interference' in Pakistan's affairs has been built over the years due to the strategic and military partnership between the two countries earlier during the cold war and later during the post 9/11 era. Markey describes US Pakistan relations as 'tortured', comparing it

with Sartre's depiction of three sinners doomed to torment each other forever.<sup>39</sup>

The roller coaster history of US Pakistan relations ,the post 9/11 'War on Terror' , the continuing drone strikes in the country , have intensified anti-US sentiment in Pakistan, providing perfect justification to the militants' struggle against Pakistani state and army for fighting an American war. The reported high civilian casualty rate during US drone strikes, which according to one estimate, goes up to 24%, generates sympathy for militants' worldview and support for militant narratives.<sup>40</sup> The liberal US aid to Pakistan has done little to improve US image in the country. The aid relationship between the two states remains complex as both tend to have varied perspectives on key issues despite their mutual interdependence.<sup>41</sup>The trust deficit at top level is reflected at popular level.

Moreover, the enduring Palestine issue, atrocities committed by Israeli troops on Palestinian soil and the perceived American support to Israel, is another major factor that breeds hostility against the Western hegemony in places like Pakistan. According to Khan;

'A paradigm has developed as an extension of the " war against Islam" narrative which encourages the audience to see events through "us vs. them" lens, with the 'world of Islam' on one side and 'the West' on the other...(this paradigm)...creates a certain tolerance of extremism on the Pakistani streets, which counter- extremists struggle to dispel.'<sup>42</sup>

### **Regional and Domestic Dynamics since 1979**

The dramatic transformation of the regional scenario post 1979 left a lasting impact on the public perceptions in Pakistan. The Iranian revolution with its powerful anti US sentiment was an unprecedented development in modern history.<sup>43</sup> The jihad in Afghanistan invited Mujahideen from all over the world and later the defeat of a superpower in

Afghanistan gave a new life to the rhetoric of Islamic revival and renaissance.

The domestic political environment of Pakistan post 1979, was another major factor which supplemented religious radicalization. The politically motivated Islamization policy of Zia regime led to a notable rise in religious intolerance and sectarianism.<sup>44</sup>

Education was used as a political tool to promote a particular worldview. This led to a series of changes in national curriculum which included distortion of historical narratives, factual inaccuracies, inclusion of rhetoric, hate material and glorification of war etc.<sup>45</sup>

The militant madrasas are also a legacy of this era which changed the nature and character of this traditional institution of learning. Pakistani madrasas were extensively used for the training and recruitment of *Mujahideen* for Afghan jihad. The United States was also involved in radicalization of education in Pakistan during this time to help the cause of Afghan jihad.<sup>46</sup> For example, it has been reported that textbooks from USAID and University of Nebraska, promoting a militant worldview were distributed in Pakistani madrasas during the Afghan war.<sup>47</sup> The national education, for many years in Pakistan for various political reasons, promoted radical views which greatly influenced the minds of the subsequent generations.

### **The Security Paradigm**

The military establishment in Pakistan has set the direction, priorities and policies of the country for most part of its history. The dominance of military establishment on country's affairs has earned it the title of a '*parallel state*'.<sup>48</sup> The military dominance weakened the democratic institutions in the country and undermined the authority of a constitutional state.<sup>49</sup> Moreover, the security paradigm created by the military got Pakistan involved first in the Cold War and then in the US War on terror. The military strategy to

support militant groups like Taliban in Afghanistan, *Harkatul Mujahideen* in Kashmir<sup>50</sup>, empowered the non-state militant actors and created a risk for country's security by enhancing internal radicalization and inviting external intervention.

So it was a complex mix of global, regional, domestic and historical circumstances that gradually transformed the traditional conservatism of Pakistani society into hostile radicalism, which is willing to buy the extremist narratives that militant groups sell in Pakistan today.

### **Exploring Alternative Narratives for Pakistan**

On an ideological ground, searching for an alternative paradigm for Pakistan which not only effectively counters the extremist paradigm but is also acceptable to the people requires a re-look to the original vision of Pakistan with a fresh perspective. Islam is the answer.<sup>51</sup> The ideas of Iqbal, the man who originally visualized Pakistan, deserve special attention. Iqbal's renowned work '*The Reconstruction of Religious Thought in Islam*' offers religious ideas which are an antithesis of fixed religious ideology propagated by radicals. Iqbal presents the idea of religious dynamism asking; 'Is the law of Islam capable of evolution?'<sup>52</sup> He cites the work of Horten<sup>53</sup> declaring that a *Muslim has always adjusted his religious outlook to the elements of culture.*<sup>54</sup>

The following ideas highlighted by Iqbal in his lecture need to be highlighted in our national curriculum and political discourse;

The spirit of Islam is so broad that it is practically boundless. With the exception of atheistic ideas alone it has assimilated all the attainable ideas of surrounding peoples, and given them its own peculiar direction of development.

Iqbal has repeatedly admired and advocated the thoughts of Rumi in his work.<sup>55</sup> The inclusive spirit of Islam represented in Rumi's thought provides a perfect antithesis to

the exclusivist radical Islam which is plaguing the Muslim world especially Pakistan.<sup>56</sup> The original values of Islamic faith based on mutual respect, compassion and appreciation of the God's diverse creation must replace the exclusivist, vengeful and radical ideology professed by militant Islamists.

Jinnah's vision needs to be understood better as well.<sup>57</sup> Ahmed describes the conversion of Jinnah's orientation in politics during the course of his political career.<sup>58</sup> He credits Iqbal for this conversion stating that Iqbal gave Jinnah an entirely new dimension to his understanding of Islam. Jinnah's vision of an Islamic society was a society that was equitable, compassionate and tolerant.<sup>59</sup> Ahmed quotes Jinnah as saying;

In any case Pakistan is not going to be a theocratic state to be ruled by priests with a divine mission. We have many non-Muslims – Hindus, Christians and Parsees – but they are all Pakistanis. They will enjoy the same rights and privileges as any other citizen and will play their rightful part in the affairs of Pakistan.<sup>60</sup>

Fazlur Rahman<sup>61</sup> was another powerful voice neglected in Pakistan. His work, especially 'Islam and Modernity; Transformation of an Intellectual Tradition' needs to be carefully studied by those looking for counter narratives for Pakistan. In this work Rahman contends that

At the time of its inception, Pakistan's leaders were generally highly liberal, and, while they wanted to inform their educational system with an Islamic orientation, this Islamic orientation, in their eyes, was not only tolerant but positively liberal'.<sup>62</sup>

He suggests that it was Islamic education, more than Science and Technology education that demanded attention in Pakistan for '...nuclear technology could be acquired from abroad ...but Islamic thought or rather the capacity for original Islamic thought could not be acquired by Pakistanis either in a Western country or in a Muslim one.'<sup>63</sup> But

Rahman notes regretfully that as an ideological state Pakistan failed 'to create an intellectual base for itself',<sup>64</sup> mostly due to a lack of a milieu of intellectual freedom and an ill founded fear of applying modern research techniques to Islamic materials.<sup>65</sup>

A number of scholars in recent years have pointed towards the need to propagate the intellectual and compassionate side of Islam in order to curb the extremist tendencies. *A Letter to Pakistan*, a manuscript by the renowned American scholar of comparative religion Karen Armstrong, specifically addresses the Pakistani people and pleads them to value and practice the compassion inherent in their religion.<sup>66</sup> Abdullahi Ahmed An Naim, a distinguished Professor of Law and Islamic sharia, argues that the coercive enforcement of Islam by the state or any other institution is against the Islamic principles which clearly give a free choice to man in terms of his beliefs and actions. He asserts that one can only be a Muslim by free choice not by the enforcement of state or other institutions.<sup>67</sup> Tariq Ramadan, a Swiss academic philosopher, who is also the grandson of Hasan al Bana of Egypt, repeatedly asserts on various forums that there is no war between Islam and the West and the militant Muslims have in fact 'hijacked' Islam.<sup>68</sup>

Fethullah Gulen is a renowned Turkish preacher whose teachings are based on Turkish religious scholar Said Nursi's ideas. He has been actively preaching interfaith harmony, faith based education and service to humanity as key elements of Islamic practice. He inspired a worldwide movement called *Hizmet* movement (*Hizmet* means 'service' in Turkish) which played a key role in Turkey's recent social transformation.

Faith based peace building is an approach which emphasizes the role of religion in conflict prevention, conflict resolution and building peace. The religious ideas of compassion, tolerance and regard for others form the core of faith based peace building.<sup>69</sup> Qamar-ul-Huda , a scholar of Islamic theology and ethics at United States Institute of Peace, in a book titled 'Crescent and the Dove', focuses on contemporary Islam and peacemaking, exploring diverse

interpretations, concepts and problems in the field of Islamic peacemaking and peace building.<sup>70</sup> Esposito and Yilmaz examine Fetullah Gulen' opinion on freedom of thought, pluralism, secularism and democracy describing their positive impact on faith based peace-building initiatives.<sup>71</sup>

Some key local and international research institutions including United States Institute for Peace<sup>72</sup> and Pakistan Institute for Peace Studies<sup>73</sup> have recently advocated the need to build peace through religion in the context of Pakistan.

There is a rich heritage of Muslim scholarship in modern times which needs to be explored, understood and promoted through media and education in Pakistan. It is only within the shared paradigm of religion that Pakistanis may be convinced to alter their radical perceptions. Counter terrorism efforts have a greater chance of success when they engage with the popular narratives; they are doomed to fail if they remain ignorant of them.<sup>74</sup>

## **Conclusion**

A viable long term counter terrorism strategy in Pakistan must aim to segregate the militants from the common man. The state of Pakistan in order to convincingly win the battle with the militants must challenge them in the realm of ideas. The following recommendations must be considered for this purpose;

- Education remains the key. For de-radicalization of the society the national curriculum, in general, and the Social Science curriculum in particular, must be redesigned to reduce rhetoric, develop critical thinking skills and promote the religious values of tolerance, respect for diversity and compassion.
- For this purpose the government must partner with not only religious scholars but religious intellectuals. The thoughts of Rumi and Iqbal must be studied and promoted through education and media. Faith-based

peace building must be nurtured in Pakistan to reduce radicalism in the long term.

- The electronic and print media can play an effective role to disseminate the moderate and compassionate religious ideas. Electronic media in particular should be used to promote intellectual debates and discussions. Religious scholars of international repute from all over the world should be invited for lectures and interactive sessions with Pakistani audience. The audience must include young students from universities as well as madrasas. Arranging such inclusive interactive sessions and broadcasting them to a wider audience would help people put their faith in perspective and see the broader aspects of it. The impact of extremist narratives would automatically shrink as a result.
- Social media is another medium which must be effectively utilized to reach a broader audience. The medium is already being used by the militant organizations to propagate their ideas. Instant communication and inter connectedness provided by social media can be used to form a broader forum for dialogue. Opening up to constructive discussions and dialogue alleviates the atmosphere of ignorance under which the extremists' narratives thrive.

Pakistan faces an enemy today which has cleverly borrowed from the ideological narrative of the country to promote its radical extremist worldview. The Pakistanis seem confused in a war that is fought in the name of Islam on both sides. Many seem inclined to support the extremist groups who claim to be more Islamic than the state.

A number of factors make Pakistanis vulnerable to the extremist's propaganda; extremist's claim of fighting for supremacy of sharia, the perceived and real US interference in Pakistan in addition to their insistence on continuing drone strikes, the domination of the military mindset on state policy, the regional dynamic and use of education as a political tool in Pakistan has been one of the key factors which allow the extremist narratives to flourish in Pakistan. One important



factor for the ideological success of the militant groups is the absence of alternative ideas to challenge extremist's claim on religion.

Enlightened and compassionate spirit of Islam found in the works of Rumi, Iqbal, Fazlur Rahman and many other intellectuals in the modern Muslim world must be revived. The scholarly voices within Islamic tradition must be strengthened and promoted through education and media to counter the views projected by the militants.

## Notes

---

<sup>1</sup>Pakistan Army's operation against the militant Islamist forces in North Waziristan (FATA) including Tehrik Taliban Pakistan, Al Qaeda and Haqqani Network, launched around mid-June 2014.

For details see <https://www.ispr.gov.pk/zarbezab>.

<sup>2</sup>See Moeed Yusuf, "a Society on the precipice? examining the prospects of Youth Radicalization in Pakistan." *Reaping the DiviDenD* (2012); Moeed Yusuf. *Prospects of Youth Radicalization in Pakistan: Implications for US Policy*. Saban Center for Middle East Policy at the Brookings Institution, 2008; Smruti S. Pattanaik "'Old' Islamists and 'New' Radicals: Understanding the Politics of Religious Radicalisation in Pakistan and its Implications." *Strategic Analysis* 35, no. 4 (2011): 581-594; Rubina Saigol, "Radicalization of State and Society in Pakistan." *Heinrich Boll Stiftung Pakistan. Retrived on November* (2010); Muhammad Amir Rana, "RADICALISATION IN PAKISTANI YOUTH." *YOUTH AND TERRORISM: A SELECTION OF ARTICLES*: 15.

<sup>3</sup>'Zarb- e- Azb' is an Arabic word, Azb was the name of the sword of Prophet Muhammad (pbuh) which he used in the battle of Badar; source: <http://tribune.com.pk/story/722202/army-launches-operation-in-north-waziristan/>, June 15, 7.19 pm.

<sup>4</sup>Clint Lorimore, "Obama's challenge: addressing Muslim radicalization in Pakistan." (2009); Mohammad Waseem, *Patterns of Conflict in Pakistan: Implications for Policy*. Brookings Institution, 2011; Moeed Yusuf, "a Society on the precipice? examining the prospects of Youth Radicalization in Pakistan." *Reaping the DiviDenD* (2012); Yusuf, *Prospects of Youth Radicalization in Pakistan: Implications for US Policy*. Saban Center for Middle East Policy at the Brookings Institution, 2008; Pattanaik, "'Old' Islamists and 'New' Radicals: Understanding the Politics of Religious Radicalisation in Pakistan and its Implications." *Strategic Analysis* 35, no. 4 (2011): 581-594; Saigol, "Radicalization of State and Society in Pakistan." *Heinrich Boll Stiftung Pakistan. Retrived on November* (2010); Rana, "RADICALISATION IN PAKISTANI YOUTH." *YOUTH AND TERRORISM: A SELECTION OF ARTICLES*: 15.

<sup>5</sup>See Amil Khan *Pakistan and the Narratives of Extremism*. No. 327.US Institute Special Report, 2013; Rana, Muhammad Amir. "Counter-ideology: unanswered questions and the case of Pakistan." *Perspectives on Terrorism* 2, no. 3 (2010); Abbas, Hassan. *A profile of Tehrik-i-Taliban Pakistan*. MILITARY ACADEMY WEST POINT NY COMBATING TERRORISM CENTER, 2008.

<sup>6</sup> Listed in the text , p. 6-11.

<sup>7</sup>See Ayesha Siddiqi, "Red Hot Chilli Peppers Islam—Is the Youth in Elite Universities in Pakistan Radical?." *Paper for 'Foreign-Security Policy Series' of Heinrich Boll Stiftung* (2010): 19-20; Nazya Fiaz, "Policy Intervention in FATA: Why Discourse Matters." *Journal of Strategic Security* 5, no. 1 (2012): 49-62.

<sup>8</sup> A.H. Nayyar, and Ahmed Salim. "The subtle subversion." *The state of curricula and textbooks in Pakistan*. Urdu, English, social studies and civics. Islamabad: Sustainable Development Policy Institute (2003); Iftikhar Ahmad, "Islam, Democracy and Citizenship Education: An Examination of the Social Studies Curriculum in Pakistan." *Current Issues in Comparative Education* 7, no. 1 (2004): 39-49.

<sup>9</sup>See Constructivism ; International relations , Encyclopedia Britannica . <http://www.britannica.com/topic/constructivism-international-relations> accessed June 23, 2015.

<sup>10</sup> Hasan Askari Rizvi, " At the Brink?" in *The Future of Pakistan*. ed. Stephen P. Cohen, Lahore: Vanguard Books, 2012 : 187-192.

<sup>11</sup> Ibid

<sup>12</sup> Moed Yusuf , " Youth and the Future" in *The Future of Pakistan*. ed. Stephen P. Cohen, Lahore: Vanguard Books, 2012 : 264-268.

<sup>13</sup> Jacob N. Shapiro and Christine Fair. "Understanding support for Islamist militancy in Pakistan." *International Security* 34, no. 3 (2010): 93.

<sup>14</sup> Ziad Haider, "Ideologically Adrift" in *Pakistan beyond the crisis state*. ed. Maleeha Lodhi, London: Hurst & Company. 2011: 126-128.

<sup>15</sup> Nov-Dec 1979 Seizure of Masjid al Haram in Mecca by Islamist insurgents to overthrow the House of Saud.

<sup>16</sup> Syed Saleem Shahzad, *Inside al-Qaeda and the Taliban: Beyond bin Laden and 9/11*. London: Pluto Press, 2011: 145-148.

<sup>17</sup> Irfan Husain. *Fatal faultlines; Pakistan, Islam and the West*. New Delhi: Harper Collins. 2012: 112-114.

<sup>18</sup> Akbar S. Ahmed, " Why Jinnah Matters" in *Pakistan beyond the crisis state*. ed. Maleeha Lodhi, London: Hurst & Company. 2011 : 21-30.

<sup>19</sup> Javed Iqbal is a prominent intellectual in Pakistan and the son of the national poet and philosopher Muhammad Iqbal.

<sup>20</sup> Mujtaba Rathore and Abdul Basit, *Trends and Patterns of Radicalization in Pakistan*. Pakistan Institute of Peace Studies .2010: 8-10, accessed March 10, 2014, <http://www.san-pips.com/download.php?f=131.pdf>

- <sup>21</sup>Ayesha Siddiq, "Red Hot Chilli Peppers Islam—Is the Youth in Elite Universities in Pakistan Radical?." *Paper for 'Foreign-Security Policy Series' of Heinrich Boll Stiftung* (2010): 19-20.
- <sup>22</sup>Safdar Sial and Tanveer Anjum, *Jihad, Extremism and Radicalization: A Public Perspective*. Pakistan Institute of Peace Studies. 2010: 19, accessed March 12, 2014, <http://www.san-pips.com/download.php?f=119.pdf>.
- <sup>23</sup>Mohammad Waseem, *Patterns of Conflict in Pakistan: Implications for Policy*. Brookings Institution, 2011: 8-10.
- <sup>24</sup>Amil Khan, . *Pakistan and the Narratives of Extremism*. No. 327. US Institute Special Report, 2013: 8,11.
- <sup>25</sup>Karen Armstrong "The battle for God: fundamentalism in Judaism." *Christianity and Islam* (2001):151.
- <sup>26</sup>McCloud, Aminah Beverly, Scott W. Hibbard, and Laith Saud, eds. *An introduction to Islam in the 21st century*. John Wiley & Sons, 2013: 117.
- <sup>27</sup> See Nomani, Shibli. "Maqalat-i-Shibli." (1964). Also See Rahman, Fazlur. *Islam and Modernity: Transformation of an Intellectual Tradition*. Vol 15. University of Chicago Press. 1984:56.
- <sup>28</sup> See Mohammad Iqbal, *The reconstruction of religious thought in Islam*. Stanford University Press, 2013. Also See Fazlur Rahman, *Islam and Modernity: Transformation of an Intellectual Tradition*. Vol 15. University of Chicago Press. 1984:56.
- <sup>29</sup>Ziad Haider, *The Ideological Struggle for Pakistan*. Hoover Press, 2010.
- <sup>30</sup> Ibid
- <sup>31</sup>See Said Amir Arjomand, "The emergence of Islamic political ideologies." *The Changing Face of Religion*. Londres: Sage (1989).
- <sup>32</sup>Seyyed Vali Reza Nasr, *Mawdudi and the making of Islamic revivalism*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1996.
- <sup>33</sup> Ibid
- <sup>34</sup> A title given to Pakistan by US Pres. Eisenhower , source : Khan, Mohammed Ayub. "The Pakistan-American alliance: stresses and strains." *Foreign Affairs* (1964): 195-209.
- <sup>35</sup> A title earned by Pakistan during the Afghan war of 1980s.
- <sup>36</sup>From Khan, *Pakistan and the Narratives of Extremism*. No. 327. US Institute Special Report, 2013: 3
- <sup>37</sup>Hasan Askari Rizvi, *Pakistan and the geostrategic environment: a study of foreign policy*. St. Martin's Press, 1993.
- <sup>38</sup> Ibid
- <sup>39</sup>Daniel S. Markey, *No Exit from Pakistan: America's Tortured Relationship with Islamabad*. Cambridge University Press, 2013
- <sup>40</sup>William Saletan, *Don't Blame Drones*. April, 24, 2015. [http://www.slate.com/articles/news\\_and\\_politics/foreigners/2015/04/u\\_s\\_drone\\_strikes\\_civilian\\_casualties\\_would\\_be\\_much\\_higher\\_without\\_them.html](http://www.slate.com/articles/news_and_politics/foreigners/2015/04/u_s_drone_strikes_civilian_casualties_would_be_much_higher_without_them.html) accessed July 16, 2015.
- <sup>41</sup>See S. Akbar Zaidi , *Who benefits from US aid to Pakistan?* Carnegie Endowment for International Peace. Sep 21, 2011.

[http://carnegieendowment.org/files/pakistan\\_aid2011.pdf](http://carnegieendowment.org/files/pakistan_aid2011.pdf) accessed July 16, 2015.

<sup>42</sup>Khan, Pakistan and the Narratives of Extremism.No. 327. US Institute Special Report, 2013: 8.

<sup>43</sup>Karen Armstrong, "The battle for God: fundamentalism in Judaism." *Christianity and Islam* (2001):278.

<sup>44</sup>Touqir Hussain, "The Islamization of Pakistan, 1979-2009." (2009).

<sup>45</sup>Abdul Hameed Nayyar and Ahmed Salim. *The subtle subversion: the state of curricula and textbooks in Pakistan Urdu, English, Social Studies and Civics*. Sustainable Development Policy Institute, 2005.

<sup>46</sup>See Kronstadt, K. Alan. "Pakistan-US Relations." LIBRARY OF CONGRESS WASHINGTON DC CONGRESSIONAL RESEARCH SERVICE, 2009.

<sup>47</sup>See Christine Fair, *Militant Recruitment in Pakistan: A New Look at the Militancy-Madrasah Connection*. Asia Policy, Number 4, pp. 107-134. , 2007.

<sup>48</sup> See Mazhar Aziz. *Military Control in Pakistan: The Parallel State*. Routledge,2007.

<sup>49</sup>Ibid

<sup>50</sup> Muhammad Waseem, *Patterns of Conflict in Pakistan: Implications for Policy*.Brookings Institution,2011: 11

<sup>51</sup> Al Qaeda's master narrative ; see Khan, Pakistan and the Narratives of Extremism. No. 327. US Institute Special Report, 2013: 5,10.

<sup>52</sup> Iqbal, *The Reconstruction of Religious Thought in Islam*. Edited & annotated by M. Saeed Sheikh. Institute of Islamic Culture, Lahore.1996: 130.

<sup>53</sup> Ibid., Horten Professor of Semitic Philosophy at the University of Bonn.

<sup>54</sup> Ibid ; 130

<sup>55</sup> Ibid. , Also see *Kulliyat-e-Iqbal* by Muhammad Iqbal ; Qaiser , Nazir. Iqbal, Muhammad.*Rumi's Impact on Iqbal's Religious Thought* .Iqbal Academy Pakistan,1986.

<sup>56</sup>See for example Sefik Can. *Fundamentals of Rumi's Thought: A Mevlevi Sufi Perspective*. Tughra Books,2004; Cyrus Masroori , " An Islamic Language of Toleration: Rumi's Criticism of Religious Persecution", *Political Research Quarterly* (2009).

<sup>57</sup>Muhammad Ali Jinnah; Founder of Pakistan.

<sup>58</sup>Akbar S.Ahmad.Jinnah, Pakistan and the Islamic Identity.The Search for Saladin .Oxford University Press. 1997:73-74.

<sup>59</sup>Akbar S. Ahmad, " Why Jinnah Matters" in *Pakistan beyond the crisis state*.ed. MaleehaLodhi, London: Hurst &Company.2011 : 28 .

<sup>60</sup>Ibid., Jinnah, Feb 1948; in a broadcast to the people of United States of America , p.28.

<sup>61</sup>Fazl ur Rahman (1919-1988), A Pakistani American scholar , who served as head of the Insitute of Islamic Research in Pakistan during 1960s and as Professor of Islamic thought in University of Chicago.

---

<sup>62</sup>Fazlur Rahman. *Islam and Modernity: Transformation of an Intellectual Tradition*. Vol 15. University of Chicago Press. 1984:111.

<sup>63</sup> Ibid, 113

<sup>64</sup> Ibid, 117

<sup>65</sup> Ibid, 120

<sup>66</sup> See Karen Armstrong, *A Letter to Pakistan*. Oxford University Press. 2011.

<sup>67</sup> Abdullahi Ahmed An-Naim. *Islam and the Secular State: Negotiating the future of Sharia*. Harvard University Press. 2009.

<sup>68</sup> See for example Tariq Ramadan. *The Paris attackers hijacked Islam but there is no war between Islam and the West*. *The Guardian*. 9 Jan, 2015. <http://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2015/jan/09/paris-hijackers-hijacked-islam-no-war-between-islam-west> accessed July 16, 2015.

<sup>69</sup> See Tsjeard Bouta, S. Ayse Kadayifci –Orellana & Muhammad Abu Nimer (2006). *Faith based peace building; Mapping the analysis of Christian Muslim and multifaith actors*. Netherland Institute of International Relations. [http://www.clingendael.info/publications/2005/20051100\\_cru\\_paper\\_faith-based%20peace-building.pdf](http://www.clingendael.info/publications/2005/20051100_cru_paper_faith-based%20peace-building.pdf) accessed June 24, 2015 ; p 1.

<sup>70</sup> Huda, Qamar-ul. *Crescent and dove: peace and conflict resolution in Islam*. US Institute of Peace Press, 2010.

<sup>71</sup> John L. Esposito, and Ihsan Yilmaz. *Islam and Peacebuilding: Gulen Movement Initiatives*. Blue Dome Press. 2010: 25.

<sup>72</sup> See USIP publications : Qamar-ul Huda, ed. *Crescent and dove: peace and conflict resolution in Islam*. US Institute of Peace Press, 2010; Susan Hayward, "Religion and Peacebuilding." (2012); David R Smock and Qamar-ul Huda. *Islamic peacemaking Since 9/11*. United States Institute of Peace, 2009.

<sup>73</sup> See *Engaging Religious Scholars for Promotion of Peace*. Pakistan Institute for Peace Studies ; source: <http://www.san-pips.com/download.php?f=112.pdf>.

<sup>74</sup> Khan, Pakistan and the Narratives of Extremism. No. 327. US Institute Special Report, 2013